

HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A WEAPON IN OUR ENEMIES' HANDS

A Thesis

Presented to the

Faculty of the College of Graduate Studies of

Angelo State University

In partial fulfillment of the

Requirements for the Degree

MASTER OF ARTS

by

JAMIN GOECKER

May 2015

Major: Security Studies

HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A WEAPON IN OUR ENEMIES' HANDS

by

JAMIN GOECKER

APPROVED:

Dr. Bruce Bechtol Jr.

Dr. Anthony Celso

Dr. William Taylor

Dr. David Dewar

05/11/15

APPROVED:

Dr. Susan E. Keith

Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Table of Contents

Title Page.....	i
Electronic Signature Page.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iii
Abstract.....	iii
Introduction.....	1
Literature Review.....	5
Chapter One: Global Perspective.....	11
Chapter Two: Conducive Conditions	32
Chapter Three: ISIS.....	54
Chapter Four: The Albanians.....	70
Chapter Five: North Korea.....	90
Conclusion.....	106
Bibliography.....	114

Abstract

Fairly recently in history, most societies abolished slavery, but the practice continues to thrive in different forms. Unfortunately, the enemies of the U.S. have adopted it as a tool to strengthen themselves. Chapter one covers this versatile topic by focusing upon the global scale of it and its different embodiments. Chapter two discusses the conditions in which human trafficking thrives. Chapter three explores the ways a terrorist organization uses human trafficking. Chapter four covers the ways organized crime uses it to generate money. Chapter five discusses how rogue nations use it to support themselves. These chapters demonstrate how human traffickers use globalization, culture, and religion to operate

Introduction

Insidious: the word properly captures the reemergence of slavery in the 21st century and its capacity to thrive in the shadows. Slavery has existed throughout the millennia, and it has acclimated quite well to today's modern, globalized world. It has adapted so well that it holds the dubious honor of being the second most profitable international crime, surpassed only by the drug trade.¹ According to the International Labor Organization (ILO), 21 million people worldwide are victims of forced labor with roughly 4.5 million victims falling prey to sexual exploitation and 2 million victims filling the ranks of state and rebel militaries.² This is human trafficking, a term henceforth used interchangeably with slavery.

The humanitarian issue aside, this is an issue that should be considered carefully by national security experts and its perceived threat reevaluated for a few reasons. First, human trafficking weakens already weak states and strengthens organized crime. This creates powerful men in the crime world with an agenda of creating further chaos for their gain. Second, human trafficking should be viewed no longer as simply a moral abomination or law enforcement problem because it has been adopted by terrorists, organized crime and military groups for sustaining themselves. As such, it has become a weapon in the hands of the enemies of the U.S. Left alone, they will continue using human trafficking to strengthen themselves and achieve their missions.

According to the United Nation's Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), there is no real way to ascertain the number of trafficked victims. However, it estimates that 2.5 million

¹Louise Shelley, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 7

²International Labor Organization, *Forced Labor, Human Trafficking and Slavery*, URL: <<http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm>>, accessed 27 February, 2015

victims is a conservative number, and it yearly generates tens of billions of dollars.³

According to a UNODC report, acquiring data to determine the extensiveness of human trafficking is difficult because that data collected by states was not originally intended to be used for that purpose. After informing the nations what kind of data to collect, however, it is hoped that better information will be available in the future.⁴

It is clear that slavery preys on the vulnerability of its victims and benefits from the weakness of states and global recessions. In a recession, the rich lose copious amounts of money but the poor in developing countries can lose the bare necessities to survive.⁵ Drought, earthquakes, civil wars, religious extremism, and weak governments with corrupt officials make people desperate. Human traffickers expertly adapt to local laws, customs, and culture to exploit these vulnerable individuals.

Victims are used in various ways. In regions engulfed by civil war, such as Uganda or the Democratic Republic of the Congo, children are kidnapped and forced to serve in paramilitary groups. In Eastern Europe, a weak economic system after the collapse of the Soviet Union and the end of the Cold War led to many unemployed women, prime targets for tricking into sexual slavery with promises of employment abroad. In Brazil, laborers are deceived into giving away their identification cards and are then coerced into making

³United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Human Trafficking FAQs*, URL: <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/faqs.html#Who_are_the_victims_and_culprits_of_human_trafficking>, accessed 10 March, 2015

⁴United Nation Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), Global Report on the Trafficking in Persons, *Human Trafficking: A Crime that Shames Us All*, February 2009

⁵Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 44

charcoal in abject conditions until they die or escape.⁶ These are but a few examples, but they demonstrate the versatility of this trade and its global reach.

This new form of slavery has evolved for decades, but has only fairly recently been investigated as a possible national security threat. With increased research, professionals and citizens alike are realizing the importance of human trafficking and just how expansive it is. Robert Hunter, a former U.S. ambassador to NATO, said, “I suspect the magnitude [of human trafficking] wasn’t understood because people essentially weren’t looking for it.”⁷

For example, the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) has adopted slavery as a way to bolster recruitment and exert their power over a region by giving women in captured areas as “brides” or concubines to its fighters. ISIS justifies its enslavement of populations by its interpretation of the Quran. The leaders of ISIS have so thoroughly adopted slavery as a legitimate practice that they have released pamphlets in the recently conquered Mosul, Iraq, explaining their rights to enslave the populace and what rights, few as they are, the inhabitants have under this system.

Global efforts to stifle this trade thus far have seen mixed results. In 2000, in a bid to combat transnational crime, the UN convened the United Nations Convention against Transnational Crime, which was supported by three protocols. One of those protocols, the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, serves as a guideline for anti-human trafficking laws.⁸ It laid the groundwork for a global response to a global problem. As of 2008, 66% of the 155 countries and territories that signed the protocols have

⁶Kevin Bales, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (Berkley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 128

⁷Robert Hunter, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

⁸United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols*, URL:

<<http://www.unodc.org/unodc/treaties/CTOC/>>, accessed 10 March, 2015

passed laws against trafficking in the first year, more than doubling the number of nations with anti-trafficking legislation.⁹ However, while some countries took rigorous steps to enforce the protocol, there remain pockets throughout the world that either failed to create effective laws to prosecute this crime or lacked the will to enforce those already in place. Few prosecutions, in comparison to the number of perpetrators, have taken place.

The U.S. has led in combating human trafficking and will likely continue to do so. However, human trafficking's applicability to national security transcends national borders and requires a concerted effort by the international community. One nation, even the United States, cannot stop a crime with so high a profit margin and so few risks, especially when slavery is empowered by a rapidly expanding global world, culture, and radical religion.

⁹UNODC, *A Crime That Shames Us All*, 8

Literature Review

Over 12.3 million¹ mothers, fathers, brothers and sisters around the world are forced into labor and sexual exploitation in one of the most vicious and efficient forms of crime in history. As of 2006, this crime has surpassed all other forms of international crime, save for drugs,² because of the ease with which it can operate profitably not only in the shadows but also in broad daylight. This crime is known as human trafficking.

Diminishing borders after the collapse of the Soviet Union and leaps in globalization has improved the lives of millions, but it has also opened the door for increased human trafficking. Also, the world's population has tripled from two billion in 1945 to six billion today. This growth largely comes from poor regions and accelerates the expansion of trafficking.³ This crime has thrived within every country as its victims and masters work in the shadows as prostitutes in Thailand to labor camps in North Korea, to boys forced to join the ranks of the Lord's Resistance Army in Uganda, to the systematic rape of women in Iraq and Syria by ISIS. This is modern slavery, and it is flourishing.

⁴This study demonstrates how human trafficking has evolved into a weapon that terrorists, crime syndicates and nongovernmental actors in failing states use to 1) indirectly thwart the U.S. by destabilizing good governance around the globe and 2) directly by using it to financially support attacks on America. As a tool of our enemies, human trafficking

¹Louise Shelley, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 5

²Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 7

³Kevin Bales, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (Berkley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press, Ltd, 2012), 12

demands our attention.⁵ These groups use human trafficking to create instability and cultivate corruption around the world. Thus, key variables in this study will be human trafficking, crime, terrorism, political instability and corruption. Subtopics will cover specific regional analysis, anti-trafficking legislation, and trafficking's strengths and weaknesses.

This study will evaluate the ways in which human trafficking is fostered in an environment of corruption, instability and how regions with these qualities have a higher rate of trafficking. The U.S. and international response will be evaluated how effectively it has combated this growing phenomenon. There are many studies about human trafficking, but this project focuses upon how it is used in the hands of terrorists and those who are hostile to America. Understanding not only the scope of human trafficking but also its strategic significance and evolving nature will aid the U.S. in formulating decisive policies to combat it.

One weakness of this study is lack of direct contact with victims of this crime or the traffickers. Also, uncovering reliable data has proven difficult thus far because human trafficking avoids detection. The extensiveness of human trafficking can only be roughly estimated after gathering data from those who escape. Thus, it is like measuring a shadow of a beast instead of the actual beast. Thus, erring on the side of smaller numbers for the sake of avoiding the appearance of hyperbole appears necessary.

Another weakness is that human traffickers are constantly developing new ways of expanding their business and once information reaches scholarly circles, some of the information may be already obsolete. Without knowing exactly how they are expanding and

⁵Aki Peritz, Tara Maller, "The Islamic State of Sexual Violence," September 16, 2014, *Foreign Policy*. URL: <http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2014/09/16/the_islamic_state_of_sexual_violence_women_rape_iraq_syria>, accessed September 17, 2014

what tools they plan to use, it may prove difficult to formulate a response. With the knowledge available, however, it appears that a good response can be arranged.

Notwithstanding, excellent material exists that sheds light on this practice.

Kevin Bales provides an outstanding view of modern slavery and discusses how modern slavery differs from that of slavery in years past in his book *Disposable People*. He points out that slavery historically differs from modern slavery because slaves in the modern world are “disposable.” Bales points out that in the new slavery, responsibility for the slaves wellbeing is easily avoided, unlike the past relationship between slave owner and slave. Owners were obligated to care for their slaves because of the long term investment. Slave and master were bound together in this relationship. Now, there is a foggy layer of management separating owner from slaves making this crime difficult to uncover and also diminishing responsibility of the former system.⁶ He believes that rapid industrialization, displacement of poor farming communities, an expanding population, and greed has accelerated trafficking.⁷ Bales also points to the global breakdown of traditional familial and communal ties in the new world as a reason for trafficking’s increase.⁸

Louise Shelley offers an excellent source of information about the international crime aspect of human trafficking in her book *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective*. She is the founder and director of the Terrorism, Transnational Crime and Corruption Center at George Mason University and is a leading expert on transnational crime and terrorism. Her emphasis upon the organized crime aspect and detailed description of the supply and demand of human trafficking set it apart from my other sources. Her insights into the criminal and terrorism

⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 237

⁷Bales, *Disposable People*, 232

⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 13

aspect of human trafficking are very helpful in this study, along with her description of each region's "business models" for human trafficking. She concludes that the way to combat human trafficking is not to formulate one over-arching strategy but to study each region's "business model" and find its weakness.⁹

Perhaps the simplest part of this research was discovering how ISIS uses slavery to benefit itself. Luckily for researchers, ISIS has a policy of not allowing foreign media to shape the perception of its group. "Don't hear about us, hear from us" is their mantra, improving upon former terrorist groups that allowed media to shape their image.¹⁰ With that being the case, ISIS provides ample information about their use of slavery and how it fits into their vision of the world through releasing pamphlets in areas they have conquered and publishing their thoughts in *Dabiq* magazine, a magazine ISIS established to spread its propaganda.

Criminals in organized groups were not as forthcoming with their strategies and philosophies, but regardless, many sources provided analysis. The works of Alexis A. Aronowitz in *Human Trafficking: Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* and other articles provide a good view into this world. Articles by Shelley provided good information on this topic. Jana Arsovska also provided excellent information about the

⁹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 132

¹⁰Michael Weiss, Hassan Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror [Kindle Edition]*, (New York, New York: Simon and Schuster Digital Sales Inc.), location 2464

impact of globalization upon organized crime, the Albanian culture, and how human trafficking has evolved in the Balkans in several articles.

North Korea provided a bit of a challenge in acquiring information and its use of human trafficking. Because the country exercises tight control of information going from and into the country, it required more reliance on reports from survivors who escaped. Also, reports from organizations like Amnesty International and testimony before various governmental committees provided excellent information that could be applied. An interview with Mr. Greg Scarlatoiu, Executive Director for the Committee for Human Rights in North Korea, also provided pertinent information.

Because human trafficking is fluid, articles from newspapers and reliable news outlets aided in keeping abreast of relevant information. However, newspapers' relative shortness does not offer the wealth of information of the other sources. Articles differ from my other sources because of their recentness and because of their comparative briefness. Articles also do not undergo the same scholarly scrutiny that books or articles in academic journals undergo. However, newspapers provided a way to gather information not only of human trafficking but also of opinions of individuals in other countries. Also, articles were discarded if they did not cite verifiable sources or if they made unsupported claims. Organizations created for the purpose of ending human trafficking were avoided because their priority is to end a practice first and foremost and not necessarily to provide accurate information; some, such as Polaris, appear inclined to hyperbole. That is not to say organization reports will not be used, but prudence will be exercised when making assertions based off of reports. Government reports, like the Trafficking in Persons (TIP), will be more willingly utilized.

In conclusion, this thesis seeks to exploit primary and secondary sources to shed light on this broad, but evasive, topic. Avoiding exaggeration, while also giving credence to the enormity of the problem, will be essential in providing a reliable picture of the situation that can be used to see how human trafficking, or modern slavery, changes the landscape of terrorism, improves the money-making capabilities of organized crime, and helps empower rogue states.

Chapter One: Human Trafficking

Overview of a Global Crime

Modern slavery permeates every corner of the world and differs from historical slavery because it has no regard for race or gender. Elements of “otherness” persist, such as the Yazidi in Mosul, and enslaved bricklayers in Pakistan who are Christian. Being a part of one of these groups is considered a likelihood that someone will be exploited, but it is not the main reason they are enslaved.¹ Slavery has existed throughout history, but it has reemerged in the past decades with the advent of globalization, the rapid spread of information, capital and people, and the upheaval this has created in parts of the world. While many nations have benefited from globalization, others have failed to take advantage of the interconnected world.

Some nations are unfortunate to have corrupt leaders that have fostered cronyism² and lost its legitimacy in the eyes of its citizens. In so doing, these leaders have encouraged years, if not decades, of civil war. Others are not geographically blessed with natural resources. Some, like North Korea, have completely sequestered themselves from globalization as a way to shield its populace from foreign influence and in so doing maintain control.

Whatever the reason, failing to take advantage of globalization has made these nations poorer as other nations become richer. Lack of alternatives compel people in

¹Kevin Bales, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (Berkley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 11

²R.I. Rotberg, “Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States: Causes and Indicators”, Chapter 1 in *Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States*. World Peace Foundation, 2003, 8

developing nations to violent behavior,³ making the citizens from these nations vulnerable to crimes like human trafficking. There are a multitude of variables that require examination to understand this crime and ultimately how it impacts the interests of the United States.

Pino Arlacchi, executive director of the U.N. Office for Drug Control & Crime Prevention in Vienna, and author of the recent book, *Slaves: The New Traffic in Human Beings* says that, "It's the fastest-growing criminal market in the world."⁴ Unfortunately, it also targets women and children disproportionately. More and more children are targeted for participation in the sex trade as clients attempt to avoid AIDs.⁵ It is important to realize not all human trafficking is perpetrated by organized crime. Government, militaries, police, security elites, and sometimes even elite families also partake.⁶

The Process

There are three phases that every human trafficking operation will more or less adhere to: recruitment, transportation, and exploitation. Once ensnared, their traffickers confiscate their passports and eliminate their communication with the outside world. Also, they are usually told they have acquired a debt in transporting them to their location that must be paid. How these steps are taken, however, differs from region to region and from operation to operation. Regardless, the victims usually experience a high level of violence, and deception always plays a role in the process. Because traffickers are excellent at adapting

³James H. Mittleman, *Hyper-Conflict: Globalization and Insecurity* (Stanford Security Studies, Kindle Edition, 2010), 43

⁴Gail Edmondson, Kate Carlisle, Inka Resch, Karen Nickel Anhalt, and Heidi Dawley "Workers in Bondage (int'l edition): Europeans are only now learning of the horror of widespread sweatshops that use forced immigrant labor" *Business Week Online*, November 27, 2000 Issue, URL: <http://www.businessweek.com/2000/00_48/b3709036.htm>, accessed January 28, 2015

⁵Louise Shelley, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 143

⁶Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 150

to the laws and customs of each region, there are a number of different business models used by traffickers that fit the general approach of each region. This list is by no means exhaustive and is a very broad overview. These criminals adopt new methods on a regular basis because of the flexibility they enjoy.

The Chinese Model

The Chinese model of human trafficking is unique because it does not rely as heavily upon violence to sustain itself as the other forms of trafficking but not because of a desire to act humanely. The criminal groups see slaves as long-term investments who need to be healthy.⁷ Another reason that Chinese traffickers want their victims healthy is so that they can return to their communities and recruit their friends and family into the system. This has been largely successful because traffickers usually target small, poor, rural communities,⁸ and the villagers would not trust outsiders as easily. The process is very detailed and relies to a large extent upon corruption within governments and law enforcement agencies.⁹ Chinese traffickers usually launder money earned through underground banks and which allows them to evade tracking.¹⁰ Another unique aspect of Chinese human trafficking is that some groups specialize in human trafficking whereas organized crime organizations elsewhere in the world use human trafficking to supplement their income.¹¹

⁷Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 118

⁸Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 118

⁹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 115

¹⁰Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 116

¹¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 141

While the majority of China's human trafficking is done within its borders, there are 600,000 migrant workers who can fall prey to false promises and be enslaved.¹² "While many instances of trafficking occur within China's borders, Chinese men, women, and children are also subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking in other countries. Chinese men and women are forced to labor in service sectors such as restaurants and shops, in overseas Chinese communities. Chinese men experience abuse at construction sites and in coal and copper mines in Africa, and they face conditions indicative of forced labor, such as withholding of passports, restrictions on movement, non-payment of wages, and physical abuse. High recruitment fees, sometimes as much as the equivalent of approximately \$70,000, compound Chinese migrant workers' vulnerability to debt bondage."¹³

Post-Soviet/Russian Business Model

The Post-Soviet business model differs from other methods because of its headlong pursuit of short-term gain and little concern for maintenance of supply or long-term business strategy.¹⁴ The Chinese use a small portion of their girls to recruit others in an effort to maintain a steady supply of victims. The Post-Soviet business model, however, does not practice this strategy to the extent that the Chinese do. Traffickers within Russia have usually received higher education and they hire ex-military personnel to help with their operations.¹⁵ The criminals usually establish control over other areas of the underground economy before

¹²United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking, "The Trafficking Situation in China," URL: <<http://www.no-trafficking.org/china.html>>, accessed February 17, 2015

¹³United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report 2014*, URL: <<http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2014/index.htm>>, accessed January 23, 2015, 132

¹⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 118

¹⁵Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 119

attempting to traffic humans.¹⁶ The Russian traffickers typically recruit their victims by advertising fake job openings with sensational offers on websites, adopt unwanted children from hospitals, purchase children from alcoholic parents, and use new technology as best they can to reach potential victims.¹⁷ Current victims do not come into contact with the next victims.¹⁸

Violent Entrepreneur Model

Groups that adopt this approach typically originate from the Balkans and exercise control over women throughout the whole process, starting from the time of recruitment, the transportation stage to Europe, and when they are in brothels or being exploited another way.¹⁹ These groups work in very diversified operations, dealing in drugs and weapons in addition to trafficking women for sexual exploitation.²⁰ This model of business differs from the others because of its integration with other business ventures, its willingness to use violence, and its tight control over its victims. Sadly, the focus upon human trafficking for sexual exploitation was accelerated as a result of the UN Peacekeepers in Serbia and Bosnia 1992-1995.²¹ Groups operating in this region benefit from less travel expenses because they travel within west and east Europe with largely open borders due to treaties like the Schengen Agreement, implemented in 1995, and thus not as high of a need to bribe border guards.²² I will further discuss the Albanians in chapter four.

American Pimp Model

¹⁶Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 119

¹⁷Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 119

¹⁸Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 119

¹⁹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 121

²⁰Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 121

²¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 121

²²Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 121

Though not as widespread as other countries, human traffickers operate in the U.S. though they have adapted considerably to the more stringent challenge of working in the United States. This model is unique because of the lavish lifestyle of pimps and the little to no savings put aside as a result because of the lack of concern about long-term sustainability.²³ Traffickers are typically American-born, and they work in loosely organized, supportive criminal networks.²⁴ They seek out runaway and homeless children and young victims on the streets or they look for them at malls and bars.²⁵ The girls are promised lavish lifestyles by men who appear rich and powerful due to their carefully groomed image, and the men use drugs and psychological control to maintain power over the girls.²⁶ Though violence is not as prevalent in this model as it is in others, it is not a safe environment. A third of prostitutes in the U.S. have broken bones or teeth due to beatings.²⁷

From the unpublished autobiography of Taquarius Ford, an American pimp currently on trial in Portland, Oregon, we can see the inner workings of a prostitution operation through the pimp's perspective. Ford brags about having a different car for every day of the week. Ford talks about empowering the women and giving them more opportunities. He also says that he must impress upon them the need to keep quiet about who they work for and never tell the police. "I will bail you out," he told his women.²⁸ He also gives his advice about how to tell if someone is involved in a sting operation. If the man calls from a motel or

²³Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

²⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

²⁵Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

²⁶Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

²⁷Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

²⁸Tarquarius Ford, *Denial of a Pimp* (unpublished), currently held as evidence in Ford's trial, prosecuted by Stacie F. Beckerman, URL: <<https://www.scribd.com/doc/217549648/Denial-of-a-Pimp>>, accessed February 26, 2015,

hotel and refuses to drink alcohol, then it is an undercover law enforcement officer; police are not allowed to drink while operating in a sting.²⁹

Once girls have been recruited, then the pimps use technology to train them and market their services. For example, pimps give women instructional videos for prostitution and advertise their services on sites like Craigslist and escort websites.³⁰ What makes this form of trafficking especially intriguing is the level which the American public seems to be romanced by pimps. A ball exists every year for pimps where the “Pimp of the Year” award and other prizes are given out.³¹ There exists an urban subculture in America that is intrigued by pimps and their image of power without considering how they achieved their power. After gaining some degree of wealth by pimping, they are then free to invest in legal business ventures,³² forging an alliance between the illegal and legal economy.

Supermarket Model

This model of human trafficking occurs primarily in the Americas along the U.S.-Mexico border. This model depends upon a large volume of victims to create a low cost for consumers³³ similar to the concept of a supermarket. This market came to being with the need to transport large numbers of Mexicans across the U.S. border. Individuals who transport people illegally in this way are called human smugglers and are not necessarily human traffickers, though they have the opportunity to exploit the situation. Gangs along the

²⁹Ford, *Denial of a Pimp*, 12

³⁰Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

³¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 123

³²Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 125

³³Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 125

border are diversifying their illicit businesses by using their drug routes for smuggling people and for human trafficking.³⁴

The price for operating, however, has increased in recent years due to the terrorist attacks on the World Trade Centers and increased border security. Smuggling used to cost several hundred dollars, while now it costs several thousand,³⁵ and the victim's chances of being discovered or trafficked have not declined. In order for this trade to flourish, however, a certain amount of corruption is needed. U.S. law enforcement estimates that as many as 90% of Mexican border patrols could be taking bribes in one way or another.³⁶ How they arrived at these estimates would greatly determine the validity of a topic renowned for being difficult to measure.

What we know for sure, though, is that tougher border restrictions have actually increased the need for human smugglers along the border.³⁷ This has provided human traffickers an excellent opportunity to not only exploit a large pool of victims, but also to make them pay for the trip across the border. What sets the Mexican human trafficking model apart from other regions is that the money is not stockpiled but is put to work quickly to generate more income in legitimate businesses like agriculture.³⁸

Nigerian-West African Model

Women trafficked from west Africa are unique because they are recruited typically by women who were trafficked themselves.³⁹ In order to spread human trafficking, Nigerian operations spend a considerable amount of money upon corrupting officials. In Nigeria,

³⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 125

³⁵Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 125

³⁶Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 126

³⁷Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 127

³⁸Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 128

³⁹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 129

government officials become direct beneficiaries of human trafficking because of the level of corruption in this country.⁴⁰ Government officials are willing to not only be silent witnesses, but will actually help with procuring passports for victims, even if the information is incomplete.⁴¹

The victims, usually women, are trafficked to European countries like the United Kingdom, Norway, and Italy, where they work as highly-visible prostitutes.⁴² There have also been reports of Nigerian women working as trafficked prostitutes in locations as far afield as Thailand. Because they stand out so well, they do not even require advertisement for their services like other prostitutes. What these operations save in advertising, however, they spend in bribing officials in Nigeria, building large houses in Edo state and buying political power.⁴³

Another unique aspect of this model of human trafficking is that women are forced to take voodoo pledges swearing they will not try to escape or tell the authorities about the operation.⁴⁴ These oaths are quite effective at controlling the victims. Very few Nigerian trafficked victims have been willing to testify in court against their masters.

Child Soldiers

Especially prevalent in Africa, the Middle East and Asia, the introduction of child soldiers has revolutionized modern warfare. Participants in warfare are no longer honored warriors but are often predators targeting the weaknesses of society.⁴⁵ These predators, militant leaders of either gangs or of religious groups like the Lord's Resistance Army

⁴⁰Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 129

⁴¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 129

⁴²Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 130

⁴³Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 130

⁴⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 129

⁴⁵P.W. Singer, *Children at War* (New York, NY: Pantheon Books, 2005), 4

(formerly) in Uganda, cannot win recruits to their cause because of their aggressive tactics. In response to this failure to win hearts and minds, leaders resorted to abducting children and forcing them to become soldiers. Financial necessity compelled many groups to adopt this tactic. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, many militant groups had to look for other ways to generate revenues without the Soviet Union's contributions.⁴⁶

Children are abducted from poor areas or they are refugees fleeing conflicts elsewhere in the region.⁴⁷ However, joining can be a mix of choice and coercion and rarely is it strictly one or the other.⁴⁸ Once abducted, it is remarkably easy to train them to handle a weapon with devastating impact. New technology in weapons that can be transported by one person such as grenades and machineguns have made the operating process so simple and the weapons so light that children can wield them.⁴⁹ A child can learn to fire, clean, disassemble and reassemble an AK-47 in thirty minutes.⁵⁰ That makes the AK-47 especially useful in addition to it being highly durable (for example, this rifle can be buried and still be serviceable with a minimal amount of cleaning).

Child soldiers have helped reshape the African region and are having increasing impact upon the struggles in the Middle East and Asia. Forty percent of armed groups in the world (157 out of 366) today use child soldiers.⁵¹ Although accurate numbers of child soldiers can be difficult to estimate, it has been roughly estimated that there are roughly

⁴⁶Singer, *Children at War*, 50

⁴⁷Singer, *Children at War*, 45

⁴⁸Michael Wessells, *Child Soldiers: From Violence to Protection* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2006), 33

⁴⁹Singer, *Children at War*, 45

⁵⁰Singer, *Children at War*, 45

⁵¹Singer, *Children at War*, 29

300,000 child soldiers in the world at any one time.⁵² That does not include those killed in combat. Militant groups are not the only ones who recruit children. Governments such as El Salvador, Iran, Burma, and others also utilize child soldiers to bolster their ranks. According to Human Rights Watch in 2002, 20% of Burma's military were children.⁵³

As an example of the destructive power of child soldiers, Charles Taylor entered Liberia with 150 followers in 1989. He initiated a policy of abducting children for soldiers and his small group mushroomed to the point that he toppled the government. Taylor terrorized the countryside and brought in \$300-\$400 million from looting and illegal trading.⁵⁴ Taylor and his fellow militant leaders were not brilliant tacticians. They merely saw that arming children enabled them to accomplish their objectives without needing a wide support base. The Lord's Resistance Army (LRA) in Uganda, for example, only had 200 followers but 14,000 children were coerced into the fight and exponentially multiplied its impact.⁵⁵

The boon that child soldiers provide for militant groups can be well understood. First, children are easy to intimidate. Whereas a certain amount of persuasion is necessary with adult fighters, it is not required with children. After being broken in, they follow orders and do not fear death partly as a result of the drugs which their commanders give to them before combat.

⁵²Human Rights Watch, "Burma: World's Highest Number of Child Soldiers" October 17, 2002, URL: <<http://www.hrw.org/news/2002/10/15/burma-worlds-highest-number-child-soldiers>>, accessed March 10, 2015

⁵³Human Rights Watch, "Burma"

⁵⁴Singer, *Children at War*, 56

⁵⁵Singer, *Children at War*, 54

Second, children are rarely paid. For example, only 10% of the children in the Congo ever receive payment for their services.⁵⁶ However, for many children receiving a fairly consistent source of food is reward enough. Many children are miserably poor and so joining a group sounds appealing. For example, two boys from Afghanistan had the option of following a cow and selling its dung, or join a military group.⁵⁷ Others feel that being in a group provides more safety and is their only option to guarantee three meals a day and medical care.⁵⁸ When put in that context, it is not hard to see why utilizing children as soldiers is alluring. Not paying these children removes a great deal of financial burden from the group and enables them to invest in other ways to advance their cause. This sharply lowers the costs for groups to militarize.⁵⁹

Third, there is an almost endless pool of children from which militant groups can recruit. Children are often trafficked across borders from neighboring countries to fight in groups and this violence reverberates back to their home country.⁶⁰ Rebels can quickly replenish their numbers, keeping conflicts alive much longer than they would have in times past.⁶¹

Fourth, some child soldiers can become quite effective in combat. A U.S. green beret in Afghanistan said child soldiers are the best soldiers in the region and that they can take on elite forces.⁶² With a steady exposure to violence, children are taught to hate outsiders and fight without regard for life. They are typically arranged into platoon group sizes of 30-40

⁵⁶Singer, *Children at War*, 55

⁵⁷Singer, *Children at War*, 63

⁵⁸United Nations, *Special Concerns*, URL: <<http://www.un.org/rights/concerns.htm>>, accessed March 12, 2015

⁵⁹Singer, *Children at War*, 95

⁶⁰Singer, *Children at War*, 108

⁶¹Singer, *Children at War*, 98

⁶²Singer, *Children at War*, 86

children and given training that is usually better than the training received by soldiers in developing countries.⁶³ After firing mortars and RPGs, they charge directly at their targets while shooting. They do not care about the chance of death. The LRA instructs its children to charge whether they have weapons or not in order to unsettle the defenders.⁶⁴ This simple strategy often proves effective, especially against poorly organized and equipped local soldiers of developing countries.

Children can also coordinate well with large operations. The Liberation Tigers of Tamil Ealam (LTTE) took Mullaitivu Fort defended by 1242 soldiers from the Sri Lankan Army where 1173 of the defenders were killed. Of the 5000 LTTE forces, only 300 were killed with 100 wounded.⁶⁵ Child soldiers have fought elite squads and fared well. LTTE's Leopard Brigade defeated Special Forces from Sri Lanka during an engagement for instance.⁶⁶ In 2000, the West Side Boys took on a British Special Air Services unit in Sierra Leone during the Okra Hills Battle. The British forces won, but they had superior training, technology, and the element of surprise and the battle still took over 6 hours and the British suffered 25 wounded and one killed.⁶⁷

Not only are children effective in combat, but they also become quite vicious. The younger a child is when recruited in such groups, the more potential they have of being a ruthless killer. As a matter of fact, there are abundant examples of younger children killing older children when they made mistakes without hesitation or remorse.⁶⁸ This is because

⁶³Singer, *Children at War*, 84

⁶⁴Singer, *Children at War*, 107

⁶⁵Singer, *Children at War*, 85

⁶⁶Singer, *Children at War*, 87

⁶⁷Singer, *Children at War*, 88

⁶⁸Singer, *Children at War*, 106

young children are undergoing their development stage and they have not fully developed a sense of judgment.⁶⁹

Child soldiers are inherently destructive for the region in which they operate. Militant groups do not have to worry about establishing a good government because they do not need the support of the population if they have a large number of children fighting for them.⁷⁰ The LRA went from 200 core members to 14,000 members by recruiting children.⁷¹ This fairly small part of the population, however, created a civil war that killed 100,000 and turned 500,000 people into refugees.⁷² In conflicts such as the one with the LRA, fighting turns from being a means to an end to an end of its own because of the loot that can be earned by militant groups.⁷³

If the children survive their time in the militant group, they are faced with very few employment prospects. They have no skills except for killing, and their education is either very disrupted or nonexistent.⁷⁴ Militant gangs target schools as a place for recruitment, but they also recognize the threat that education can pose to their groups. In Uganda, over 75 schools were burned and 215 teachers killed in one province in one year.⁷⁵ With educators being targeted so heavily and with so much of the population of Uganda living in refugee camps, the prospects for this next generation appears dim.⁷⁶ Add to this the fact that armed

⁶⁹Singer, *Children at War*, 106

⁷⁰Singer, *Children at War*, 99

⁷¹Singer, *Children at War*, 95

⁷²Singer, *Children at War*, 101

⁷³Singer, *Children at War*, 51

⁷⁴Singer, *Children at War*, 113

⁷⁵Singer, *Children at War*, 113

⁷⁶Singer, *Children at War*, 113

conflicts of the 1990s killed an estimated 2 million children to understand the impact child soldiering can have on a region.⁷⁷

If the children soldiers were suddenly released, unwillingly or not, where will they go? Many communities perceive the tattoos on child soldiers or their absence of limbs with disgust. In an interview with a man who fought for Charles Taylor, he said that “‘People in big cars, they wrinkle their noses, like ‘You fought for Taylor, you're crippled, you deserve it’. He looks at the ground. ‘We just didn't have the money to run away to America like they did.’”⁷⁸ There is an almost total absence of job offers for those who fought as children now that they are adults because of the stigma attached to them.⁷⁹

Many will not be welcome home, or they may have been orphans to begin with. Reintegrating these children back into society will be a long, difficult road. Without it, however, can there be peace in Africa? That seems doubtful if there is an exploding youth population with violence being their only trade. In addition their ties and loyalties are with small militant groups that do not serve the greater good of the country.

International condemnation of this practice has done very little to curb its expansion. Many of the groups involved ideologically have little inclination to cooperate with the international order even if they do obtain full power of the region. Add to this a religious element in the Middle East which I will discuss in a later case study, and the chances that simply making more international laws will have very little impact upon it. To date, the biggest success of international law has been of putting Charles Taylor, former leader of

⁷⁷Wessells, *From Violence to Protection*, 24

⁷⁸Finlay Young, “Lost boys: What became of Liberia's child soldiers?” in *The Independent*, Saturday 14 April, 2012, URL: <<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/africa/lost-boys-what-became-of-liberias-child-soldiers-7637101.html>>, accessed March 12, 2015

⁷⁹Young, “Lost boys”

Liberia, on trial for using child soldiers. He was sentenced to 50 years in prison for 11 war crimes and other violations that constituted acts against humanity.⁸⁰

Organ Trafficking

Though less data exists on organ trafficking than the aforementioned topics, indications point to it being a highly profitable endeavor and very likely is used as a way to fund terror groups like ISIS. How much funding is difficult to ascertain. However, examining samples from cases will give a general idea of how lucrative this underground business is.

The market for organ trafficking is immense for a number of reasons. First, people are living longer because of better healthcare in the developed world than in times past.⁸¹ That means they require more organ transplants, usually kidneys. As an example of the increased demand for kidneys alone, the supply of kidneys increased by 33% in the U.S. in the years 1990-2003 while the demand increased by 236%.⁸² Candidates for kidney transplants wait for approximately three years in Europe and the U.S. and six to eight years in Asian regions like Singapore.⁸³ What this means is that we suffer a chronic shortage and 15-30% of European patients will die waiting for a kidney, making Europe is an excellent place for transplants relevant to other regions.⁸⁴

This market creates an enormous underground economy and opportunities for organized crime and terrorist groups to raise funds. In India, for example, an operation was uncovered where middlemen, doctors and patients were revealed. It was discovered that

⁸⁰International Justice Monitor, A project of the Open Society Justice Initiative, "Charles Taylor," n.d., URL: <<http://www.ijmonitor.org/charles-taylor-background/>>, accessed February 18, 2015

⁸¹Alexis A. Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009), 110

⁸²Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 110

⁸³Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 110

⁸⁴Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 110

\$31.4 million exchanged hands in the operation.⁸⁵ Immigrants, some held at gunpoint to “donate”, were paid \$525-\$1050 for their kidneys and buyers paid \$104,600-\$209,200.⁸⁶

Clearly, a profitable market exists and is usable by terrorists.

Reports indicate that ISIS has been using organ trafficking for fundraising. This ruthless terrorist organization uses extreme forms of violence in order to draw attention to itself and send messages to the west. It also uses extreme violence to raise money for itself. Some of these methods to bring in money is oil production, drug smuggling, human trafficking, and trafficking organs for a combined yearly value of \$2 billion.⁸⁷ More information about this form of trafficking and how it helps ISIS will be presented in a coming case study.

Organ trafficking exhibits varying levels of exploitation of victims. The first are individuals who sell their organs willingly but are not informed about the true risks or the effect it will have upon them. The second are captives taken either in war or kidnapped. Their organs are harvested and the individuals are either killed or left to die with little to no medical care.

At what point does organ exploitation become human trafficking, however? Buying and selling organs, though illegal in many countries, is not human trafficking *per se*.⁸⁸ Organ trafficking turns into human trafficking when the perpetrator uses the victim’s position of

⁸⁵Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 115

⁸⁶Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 115

⁸⁷Samuel Smith, “ISIS Trafficking Human Organs from Bodies of Kidnapped Captives, Dead Soldiers and Injured Prisoners, Mosul Doctor Says” *The Christian Post*, December 8, 2014, URL: <<http://www.christianpost.com/news/isis-trafficking-human-organs-from-bodies-of-kidnapped-captives-dead-soldiers-and-injured-prisoners-mosul-doctor-says-130842/>>, accessed January 9, 2015

⁸⁸U.S. Department of State, “Topics of Special Interest” URL: <<http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2014/226646.htm>>, accessed January 8, 2015

vulnerability, usually poverty, to obtain the person's organs, according to the Palermo Protocol. Abuse of a position of vulnerability is one of the criteria used to define if a person has been trafficked.⁸⁹

Forced Labor

Sexual exploitation usually receives more attention than forced labor because we in western countries view sexual exploitation as more reprehensible.⁹⁰ However, those trapped in forced labor usually are kept in bondage for longer periods because their captors seclude them from society. Operations based upon sexual exploitation usually take law enforcement 1-2.5 years to discover whereas labor exploitation takes 4.5-6.5 years.⁹¹ Forms of forced labor exist throughout the world on a small and large scale. Servitude can be domestic service, agriculture, clearing the Amazon rain forest, bonded labor in India, or essentially as a slave for a rogue government like North Korea. There are approximately 21 million victims around the world currently enslaved for labor, according to the ILO.⁹² Migrants are highly vulnerable to this form of human trafficking due to the fact that social customs, like bonded laborers in India, are very conducive for this process. Because this thesis focuses upon human trafficking as being a weapon in the hands of our enemies, the focus will remain primarily upon the benefit that forced labor affords to rogue governments like North Korea in

⁸⁹United Nations Human Rights, Office for the High Commissioner for Human Rights, "Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime" URL: <<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/ProtocolTraffickingInPersons.aspx>>, accessed January 8, 2015

⁹⁰Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 32

⁹¹Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 32

⁹²International Labor Organization, "Forced Labor, Human Trafficking and Slavery," URL: <<http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm>>, accessed 27 February, 2015

a case study. However, a very broad picture of forced labor is necessary for the sake of context.

In 2005, for example, 270,000 of 360,000 labor victims in industrialized countries were trafficked.⁹³ Forced slave labor is perhaps the greatest example of illegal and legal businesses collaborating. Many of the immigrants are ensnared by fake employment agencies. This is accomplished through companies subcontracting aspects of their business abroad.⁹⁴ Illegal immigrants in countries are vulnerable to this form of slavery. They often feel that they cannot report their situation to the police for fear of deportation, a constant threat their masters use against them.⁹⁵ There is some validity to this fear.

In Milan, a Chinese trafficking group was uncovered that forced immigrants to work under inhumane conditions to manufacture handbags, belts, and clothes which were sold to legitimate companies in Italy's fashion industry.⁹⁶ Europe has a large garment manufacturing market that brings in approximately \$80 billion annually.⁹⁷ In order to fuel this high demand for labor, European companies have contracted out aspects of the job to others, who have in turned subcontracted the job to others. This creates an opportunity for traffickers to slip slave labor into the legitimate market.⁹⁸

According to the Trafficking in Person's Report by the Department of State, "Military and, to a lesser extent, civilian officials systematically subject civilian men, women, and

⁹³Beate Andrees, "Forced Labor: Coercion and Exploitation in the Private Economy" in *Forced Labor: Coercion and Exploitation in the Private Economy* (Boulder, CO: Lynne Reinner Publishers, INC, 2009), 89

⁹⁴Andrees, "Forced Labor", 89

⁹⁵Andrees, "Forced Labor", 101

⁹⁶Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 33

⁹⁷Edmondson, Carlisle, Resch, Anhalt, and Dawley "Workers in Bondage (int'l edition)"

⁹⁸Edmondson, Carlisle, Resch, Anhalt, and Dawley "Workers in Bondage (int'l edition)"

children to forced labor as porters, manual labor for infrastructure projects, or in state-run agricultural and commercial ventures. International organizations report this practice remains common in conflict regions.”⁹⁹ In Paris, police uncovered numerous small sweatshops in the 10th, 11th, and 13th arrondissements (an administrative district) and in the suburban neighborhoods of north and northeast Paris. Many old buildings and abandoned factories have been converted to workshops, complete with trapdoors and secret routes of escape.¹⁰⁰

These are but a few examples linking the illicit and legal market, and the chances to join them are limited largely by the human trafficker’s imagination. In 2000, it was estimated that the underground economy in Italy accounted for 28% of Italy’s gross domestic product.¹⁰¹ This is one reason why forced labor will be difficult to address in Europe; the economy benefits from the cheap labor. According to David Ould, deputy director of Anti-Slavery International, “We [Europeans] are benefiting economically” from a thriving underground economy.¹⁰²

Conclusion

In conclusion, there are many different forms of modern slavery with various levels of severity. As one can observe, there is no such thing as a “typical” victim.¹⁰³ One way or another, however, they require corruption to thrive which in turn breeds corruption within the boundaries of the country in which it operates. Many forms of human trafficking take advantage of weak governments or governments that have collapsed and cannot protect its

⁹⁹United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report 2014*, 114

¹⁰⁰Edmondson, Carlisle, Resch, Anhalt, and Dawley “Workers in Bondage (int'l edition)”

¹⁰¹Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 33

¹⁰²Edmondson, Carlisle, Resch, Anhalt, and Dawley “Workers in Bondage (int'l edition)”

¹⁰³Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 48

citizens. Some countries like North Korea and Burma use modern slavery in one way or the other to strengthen themselves.

As can be seen, human trafficking is a global phenomenon that reaches every continent in one way or the other. It erodes good government and exploits the situation in these places like Somalia, Burma, and Syria to their benefit. According to Judge Falcone, renowned for his advocating of international cooperation against the Italian mafia, we need to examine the different models and find weaknesses to the individual systems instead of simply developing a global, uniform approach.¹⁰⁴ Now that it cannot be denied that human trafficking exists, the question should be asked, “In what setting does human trafficking and slavery flourish?”

¹⁰⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 132

Chapter Two

What Conditions Nurture Human Trafficking?

That human trafficking thrives in many different forms and in all corners of the world is indisputable. One needs only to look at headlines to find examples of modern slavery. Human trafficking exists to some extent everywhere but developing nations tend to have a higher incidence of this crime.¹ Not only that, but many women who are freed from slavery return to the trade.² Why? Because there are certain conditions that prove more conducive to slavery than others. These variables are good indicators of a higher likelihood of human trafficking though the existence of one or two does not necessarily mean that human trafficking is running rampant. Conditions that appear to foster human trafficking, according to my research, has been weak and failing states, slumping economies, culture, and religion. I will examine each of these in turn.

Weak States

A weak or failed state provides the ideal situation for the violent crime and corruption needed for a thriving human trafficking business. This is because failed states cannot provide security or the due process of law for its citizens.³ They fail because of convulsing internal violence and because they cannot deliver on positive political goods.⁴ This is considered a failure on the state's part because the primary function of a state is to provide security for its

¹United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Human Trafficking FAQs*, URL: <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/faqs.html#Who_are_the_victims_and_culprits_of_human_trafficking>, accessed 10 March, 2015

²Siddharth Kara, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 115

³R.I. Rotberg, 2003. "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States." World Peace Foundation. Chapter 1, *Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States: Causes and Indicators*, 3

⁴Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 1

citizens and for the due process of law.⁵ Weak states harbor ethnic, linguistic, and religious tensions that have the potential to become violent,⁶ and they lack the political structure to peacefully resolve these conflicts.

Natural disasters give an instant insight into a country's ability to respond effectively to catastrophes which weak and failed states lack.⁷ They do not respond or accommodate effectively to economic, political or natural disasters.⁸ The Haiti earthquake of January 12, 2010 devastated the country and shattered its already weak state structure. The earthquake claimed 80,000-300,000 lives and resulted in the country slipping to the fifth spot on the Failed State Index in 2011 though Haiti was not starting from a place of strength.⁹ Haiti has never been outside of the "worst fifteen" category on the index.¹⁰ Instead of responding quickly to the disaster, the Haitian government succumbed to chaos and failed to provide its citizens with order or relief. To this day, Haiti depends upon the international community for aid, and it does not appear likely that that will change in the near future.

An example of a strong nation's response to a similar disaster would be Japan after the March 11, 2011 Great Eastern Tōhoku earthquake and tsunami. My family lived in Japan during this natural disaster and personally testify that though entire towns were wiped out by the waves that engulfed parts of the country, law and order did not break down. Citizens followed procedures that had been practiced beforehand and many lives were saved as a result. Also, law and order did not break down, and the structure of society remained intact. Though Japan has not fully recovered from the earthquake, its government's response was far

⁵Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 3

⁶Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 4

⁷The Fund for Peace, *Failed State Index 2011*, 18

⁸Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 21

⁹The Fund for Peace, *Failed State Index 2011*, 13

¹⁰The Fund for Peace, *Failed State Index 2011*, 13

superior to Haiti's. This demonstrates that failing or failed states do not respond or accommodate to challenging circumstances very well while stronger states do.

Many failed states are the legacy of bad colonial practices. Rwanda is an excellent example of colonialism that left a bad legacy for future governments. France exercised a practice while colonizing where they would choose certain ethnic groups and favor them above the other groups. These groups, usually minorities, would become the ruling class. In the case of Rwanda, the Tutsis were selected because they had fairer skin and thus were more similar to the Europeans than the Hutus. When France relinquished control of Rwanda in July 1, 1962, the country descended into a spiraling round of chaos created by generations of hatred between the Tutsis and Hutus.

Some of the ex-colonies were not states to begin with.¹¹ They were simply drawn up on a map without regarding the inhabitants or their wishes. This has added additional ways to blame the colonialism system for failed states in certain regions of the world and can partly explain why there are so many clashing ethnic groups within certain nations. Some nations that were drawn on maps and were never really states before assuming the mantle of statehood are Afghanistan, Democratic Republic of the Congo, and Sierra Leone.¹² The Congo is ranked 4th on the 2014 Failed State Index, Afghanistan is ranked 7th and Sierra Leone is ranked under the "very high warning" category at 35th.¹³

The colonial legacy is not the only variable involved in state failure, however. Though a state's strength depends largely upon its history and its natural endowments, its

¹¹Rosa Ehrenreich Brooks, 2005. "Failed States, or the State as Failure?" in *The University of Chicago Law Review*, 72(4), 1167

¹²Brooks, "The State of Failure?", 1167

¹³Fund for Peace, Fragile State Index, URL: <<http://ffp.statesindex.org/rankings-2014>>, accessed December 28, 2014 (site under maintenance during time of submission)

leaders ultimately decide its fate. Human agency, rather than structural weakness, usually is the result of states descending from a weakened state to a failed state.¹⁴ In other words, state failure is a manmade problem and depends largely upon its leadership. A leader can either steer a nation away from failure or push it over the edge.

Leaders who hurt their nations are those that lost legitimacy by pandering to the wishes of a small portion of the population. Corrupt leaders engineer economic insecurity to benefit themselves and their cronies¹⁵ demonstrating that a state crossing from weak to failed takes not only neglect but the will to fail.¹⁶ Governing with no regard for the greater good severely corrodes a leader's legitimacy.¹⁷ However, nations that are not failing have had corrupt leaders before and it did not result in the collapse of the state. Many states are weakened enough already, though, that the tenure of a bad leader can push the country over the brink.

Increased violence within a country showcases a state's weakness.¹⁸ Where there is a high amount of organized crime, there is also a high amount of corruption and low amount of state strength. Many of the advocates in Pakistan fear for their lives from organized crime groups or religious extremists. This demonstrates a weakening of state control. Power in Pakistan is shared right now with the civil government, the military, and the radical religious mullah.¹⁹ How this situation will be resolved is yet to be seen, but the populace is likely to side with whomever can provide safety and basic necessities for life. A large section of the

¹⁴Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 10

¹⁵Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 8

¹⁶Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 14

¹⁷Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 9

¹⁸Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 6

¹⁹V. Vira, and A.H. Cordesman, 2011. "Pakistan: Violence vs. Instability" A National Net Assessment, CSIS, 1

population, 94%, believe that the military has a positive influence on the country's direction.²⁰ The mullahs claim they can provide this while also promising just rewards for its followers in the afterlife.²¹ The military and mullahs could not be in such a position of power, however, without the failure of civilian government.²²

Corruption, a key component for human trafficking, results in a very opportune situation for human traffickers. Law enforcement can be corrupted with the right amount of bribes and this is crucial to a brothel owner's or human trafficker's business. According to Bales, "In Europe and North America the police fight organized crime; in Thailand, the police *are* organized crime."²³

It is not simply weak states in Africa or the Middle East that are endangered, however. A troubling new trend starting after 2002 in Europe has been that victims had obtained legitimate legal documents from embassies,²⁴ making it very likely that officers within these countries have been bribed and cooperate with the traffickers. With these documents, the victims can be transported to essentially any nation within Europe and become almost invisible to detection for human trafficking.²⁵

Corrupting officials is easier in some nations than others. Albania uses 70% of its income to pay foreign debt, meaning that its judges, lawyers, and police do not make very much money.²⁶ Because Albanian law enforcement is paid so little, they are easy to bribe.²⁷

²⁰Vira, Cordesman, "Violence Vs. Instability", 3

²¹Vira, Cordesman, "Violence Vs. Instability", 25

²²Vira, Cordesman, "Violence Vs. Instability", 10

²³Kevin Bales, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 29

²⁴Siddharth Kara, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 116

²⁵Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 116

²⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 127

The country cannot afford a witness protection program, and even if it does manage to prosecute a human trafficker, the perpetrator can simply slip over the border into Russia because Albania share no extradition agreement with Russia.²⁸

Failed states are not an exception in some parts of the world but the norm²⁹, which destabilizes the region. State failure, as one can see, cannot be predicted by examining a few variables, quantifying them somehow, and then making predictions. No single indicator exists that can measure failed states, but together, the elements provide a good idea about a state's weakness and possible failure.³⁰ Ultimately, the state's fate rests upon the decisions of its leaders. To put it succinctly, "State failure is manmade, not accidental."³¹

Economics

Kevin Bales says believes that the modern slaveholder's work would be best view it not as a criminality but as disinterested capitalism.³² Economics is a decisive factor in the likelihood of people being vulnerable to human trafficking. Poor people are more likely to accept questionable job openings, illegally migrate to another country and risk being exploited, or even sell their children as a way to pay for debt. Extreme poverty, then, is a factor that can be indicative of how prevalent human trafficking is the in the area in question. In the new globalized world, the rich can lose a great deal of money in the economic downturn whereas the poor in the developing world can lose the bare necessities to survive.³³

²⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 127

²⁸Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 127

²⁹Brooks, "The State of Failure?", 1174

³⁰Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 22

³¹Rotberg, "Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States", 22

³²Bales, *Disposable People*, 50

³³Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 44

Government corruption along with a vast new number of young people in the developing world has led to the new slavery.³⁴ The cost of purchasing sex in Italy has dropped 50% in 10 years due to the influx of sex slaves.³⁵ Supply and demand has also played a major role in the development of human trafficking. According to Kevin Bales, “For the first time in human history there is an absolute glut of potential slaves. It is a dramatic illustration of the laws of supply and demand: with so many slaves, their value has plummeted.”³⁶

For example, in 1850 the cost of a slave was roughly three to six times that of an average American laborer or \$40,000-\$80,000 in today’s currency, and the slave returned only about 5% of that value each year.³⁷ Children born into slavery made the old trade a little more profitable but still nowhere near rivaling the new slavery’s lucrativeness. Old slave owners had a clear incentive to keep their slaves healthy; they had to own them for a long time in order to regain their initial cost. In contrast, agricultural bonded laborers in India generate about 50% their value per year,³⁸ and Thai girls can be bought by brothel owners for \$800 to \$2000 and generate 800% profits.³⁹

When a slave becomes ill or injured, it is now cheaper to let them die than to spend the money to cure them.⁴⁰ With that being the case, there is little reason to invest in their upkeep and long-term wellbeing as there was in the old form of slavery.⁴¹ Slave owners now

³⁴Bales, *Disposable People*, 14

³⁵Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 89

³⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 14

³⁷Bales, *Disposable People*, 16

³⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 17

³⁹Bales, *Disposable People*, 18

⁴⁰Bales, *Disposable People*, 15

⁴¹Bales, *Disposable People*, 15

get all the work they can out of slaves and discard them.⁴² This is because the new slavery, which is underground and outside of the regulation of the government, does not hold slave owners accountable for the safety and wellbeing of the slaves. The new slavery, in terms of supply and demand, is flawless capitalism turned to evil.

Just how substantial is the impact of slave labor upon the economy? There are some rough estimates but, of course, procuring accurate numbers has proven difficult. Kevin Bales roughly estimates that the average yearly income from slaves to be around \$13 billion, which is less than the personal wealth of Bill Gates.⁴³ However, the ILO reports that labor exploitation alone brings in \$150 billion per year,⁴⁴ demonstrating the range of possible values. However, assuming the number is somewhere between those two examples, just how big of an impact does slavery have upon the economy? The answer can be found not so much in the “how much” but “where the money is used.”

In other words, the monetary value might be small, but its indirect value is high because of its contribution in the manufacturing of products. As Kevin Bales says, “Although the direct value of slave labor in the world economy may seem relatively small, the indirect value is much greater.”⁴⁵ As an example, slave-made charcoal is crucial to creating steel in Brazil which is then turned into cars, car parts, and other metal goods that comprise a quarter of Brazil’s exports.⁴⁶ Brazil then exports to many countries, including Britain, which imports

⁴²Bales, *Disposable People*, 14

⁴³Bales, *Disposable People*, 23

⁴⁴International Labor Organization, *Forced Labor, Human Trafficking and Slavery*, URL: <<http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm>>, accessed 27 February, 2015

⁴⁵Bales, *Disposable People*, 23

⁴⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 23

approximately \$1.6 billion each year from Brazil while the U.S. imports significantly more.⁴⁷ Slave labor is also used to produce goods in factories which lowers production costs.⁴⁸

Also, money generated by slavery can be used to finance other illegal activities and endeavors. The combined value of the combined five global mafias is estimated to be around \$100.9 billion per year that is generated with drugs, money laundering, extortion, and human trafficking.⁴⁹ Upper management in these mafias use the money raised through these activities to expand into other businesses like drug or arms dealing, or even legitimate businesses that will aid in human trafficking like travel agencies or job agencies.⁵⁰

Globalization

Globalization has done much to lift the standard of living for many all over the world, but it has also helped organized crime and human trafficking spread. If one region tightens its restrictions on human trafficking, then the slavers simply move their operation to a weak state that has no ability or will to combat human trafficking.⁵¹ The lack of border restrictions and the increased effort in most countries to allow connectivity with the rest of the world has also been a great boon to human traffickers

According to Robert Hunter, a former U.S. ambassador to NATO and a senior fellow with the RAND Corporation, since the end of the Cold War, borders, especially in Eastern Europe, have become more porous and easier to travel.⁵² When asked if the fall of the Soviet

⁴⁷Bales, *Disposable People*, 23

⁴⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 23

⁴⁹Chris Matthews, "Fortune 5: The biggest organized crime groups in the world" *Fortune Magazine* online edition, September 14, 2014, URL: <<http://fortune.com/2014/09/14/biggest-organized-crime-groups-in-the-world/>>, February 20, 2015

⁵⁰Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 92

⁵¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 41

⁵²Robert Hunter, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

Union impacted upon human trafficking, Hunter said, “The fall of the Soviet internal and external empire, clearly, because it opened borders, it also, if I can use a terrible word but I think it applies, the growth of entrepreneurship of where drugs and illegal trafficking appeal to entrepreneurial thugs.”⁵³

For instance, the Schengen Agreement of 1985 in Europe allowed Europeans to move between 25 European countries without needing a passport.⁵⁴ No checks on persons crossing between those borders are necessary.⁵⁵ The Open Border Agreement (1950) between Nepal and India created greater ease for commerce between these countries while also opening the door for increased human trafficking.⁵⁶ Up to 20,000 girls from poor regions in Nepal are trafficked into India on a yearly basis, demonstrating the extent to which human traffickers can exploit open borders.⁵⁷

Improvements in transportation and the deterioration of borders has empowered increased migration from troubled countries to more stable regions such as Europe and America. This influx of refugees and migrants has begun straining host nations. Some nations, such as Switzerland, have undergone a surge of immigration due in large part to its stable economy and low unemployment (3.1% compared to Europe’s 11%). Legal immigrants now comprise almost a quarter of this nation with a population of 8 million, the highest ratio of immigrants to natural citizens in Europe.⁵⁸ In response to this, Switzerland’s

⁵³Robert Hunter, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

⁵⁴Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 43

⁵⁵Schengen Agreement, June 19, 2000, Chapter I, Article II

⁵⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 67

⁵⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 50

⁵⁸Helena Bachmann, “As Europe Reels, Switzerland Builds New Barriers Against Immigrants” *TIME*, May 01, 2013, URL: <<http://world.time.com/2013/05/01/bachmann-on-switzerland/>>, accessed July 23, 2014

Federal Council announced it would introduce quotas for those residing in the country for longer than four months and that it would welcome EU workers more readily.⁵⁹

Refugees put an especially large strain on host countries. After all, refugees are rarely in a position to provide for themselves and so the host nation must provide many of the necessities of life. Pakistan currently hosts the largest number of refugees (1.6 million) resulting from the struggle in Afghanistan and Syria according to a report produced in 2013 by the United Nations High Commission for Refugees.⁶⁰ According to the same report, there are 51.2 million displaced people worldwide; these are prime victims for human trafficking.

States play an enabling role for capitalism within this globalized structure. Many nations rightly have perceived they benefit from a liberal system with open marketplaces. That said, states work to keep markets from failing.⁶¹ Despite the best efforts of states, however, markets can still take a downward spiral to the discredit of the nations involved and all who support globalization.

An example of this would be the crash of the Asian market in the late 1990s. The Asian market had become a glowing example of globalization and the miraculous growth and prosperity it could bring about. The Asian economy suffered a serious setback in 1997 when Thailand's currency, the baht, collapsed. The impact from this could not be isolated. Like a rotten apple spreading to the other apples in a barrel, the Asian market took a turn for the

⁵⁹EY, "Swiss Federal Council presents implementation plan regarding new Constitutional provisions on immigration management" July 2014, URL: <<http://www.ey.com/GL/en/Services/Tax/Human-Capital/HC-Alert--Swiss-Federal-Council-presents-implementation-plan-regarding-new-Constitutional-provisions-on-immigration-management>>, accessed February 20, 2015

⁶⁰UN High Commissioner for Refugees, *War's Human Cost: UNHCR Global Trends 2013*, June 20, 2014, URL: <<http://reliefweb.int/report/world/unhcr-global-trends-2013-wars-human-cost>>, accessed July 23, 2014 from Reliefweb.net

⁶¹James H. Mittleman, *Hyper-Conflict: Globalization and Insecurity* (Stanford Security Studies, Kindle Edition, 2010), 9

worse. When it was all said and done, the slump in the Asian market resulted in a loss of 6% of the world's GDP. Countries most affected went from \$93 million in 1996 to negative \$12 million in 1997.⁶² The impact of the crash was felt in not only the financial world but also in the international community. New governments were established in the Philippines, East Timor and South Korea as a result of this financial meltdown.⁶³

This is an example of how globalization can increase both economic growth and instability which creates the perfect setting in which human traffickers can operate. Big business, crony capitalism, poor supervision of financial institutions, lack of transparency of the economy's financial sectors and the interconnectedness of banks all led to the collapse of the market⁶⁴ among other factors like the floating of currency. Though every nation did not participate in these hazardous practices, every nation bore the consequences. It also created the question of how to strike the balance between state regulation and neoliberal demands.⁶⁵ Regulating ourselves to safety will rob us of obtaining the benefits of globalization, but we cannot say it will never happen again either way. The most we can do is minimize the negative impacts.⁶⁶

Insecurity is being globalized, according to Mittleman.⁶⁷ The massive increase of interconnectedness has done wonders for boosting economies and aiding the formulation of alliances and organizations with the goal of increasing peace and prosperity in one or more

⁶²Mittleman, *Globalization and Insecurity*, 89

⁶³Mittleman, *Globalization and Insecurity*, 92

⁶⁴Michelle Clark Neely, "Paper Tigers? How the Asian Economies Lost Their Bite," *The Regional Economist*, January 1999

⁶⁵Mittleman, *Globalization and Insecurity*, 91

⁶⁶Neely, "Paper Tigers?"

⁶⁷Mittleman, *Globalization and Insecurity*, 1

facets. However, it has also exposed every nation to the weaknesses and instabilities of other nations including poverty.

With such poverty, many promising situations exist for human traffickers. The poor Moldavian province of Gagauzia is the most highly trafficked region in the country. Men are trafficked for construction work, children for begging, and the women for prostitution.⁶⁸ In India there are some villages where almost all the inhabitants are bonded laborers, creating another perfect setting. Traffickers can simply offer to purchase children of bonded laborers from their debtor as a way to reduce their debt.⁶⁹ The debtor (or debatably “slave owner”) must make a decision in such instances if it would be more profitable to slowly extract value from the child over a period of time or to sell him/her to a buyer.⁷⁰

Women are among the biggest losers of globalization, according to a report cited by Shelley.⁷¹ To survive, women have increasingly migrated internationally to find work abroad as a solution to economic misfortune and to send remittances back to family.⁷² Some developing countries highly depend upon remittances as a way to generate money. As an example, in 2006 over \$300 million dollars returned to Moldova in the form of remittances, equivalent to 25% of the Moldova economy.⁷³ This form of income has become critical to the survival of hundreds of millions of people around the world where jobs are scarce and the value of currency is eroding due to high inflation.⁷⁴ Between 2001 and 2006, global

⁶⁸Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 123

⁶⁹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 66

⁷⁰Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 66

⁷¹Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 17

⁷²Lisa C. Ruchti, “Fear Fraud, and Complexities: The Influence of Gender on Human Trafficking” in *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives*, Ed. Mary C. Burke (New York, NY: Routledge, 2013), 99

⁷³Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 114

⁷⁴Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 115

remittances doubled, surpassing \$300 billion in 2006.⁷⁵ Countries that are desperate for tax revenue encourage their citizens to migrate and tax up to 25% of the remittances their citizens send home to their families.⁷⁶ Human traffickers exploit this reality in developing countries by offering jobs abroad and then ensnaring their victims in a web of lies and violence.

Culture

During his research, Siddharth Kara interviewed a woman in Moldova about violence against women and its impact upon human trafficking. Her response focused upon husbands abusing their wives, saying, “In America, you call police [when husbands abuse their wives], in Moldova, we call it tradition.”⁷⁷

During research, it became very apparent that culture plays a substantial role in the ability for human trafficking to thrive in certain locations. For example, Thai culture has a strong retort that epitomizes their unwillingness to look too much into others’ affairs which is “yaa suck” which means “mind your own business.” This is an ideal culture for human traffickers to exploit for their own purposes.⁷⁸ There are elements in every culture that can be twisted in one way or another and used to make human trafficking easier. However, below are some cultural aspects that make human trafficking particularly easy to operate and difficult to prosecute.

The Kanun

⁷⁵Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 115

⁷⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 115

⁷⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 124

⁷⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 50

Violence against women is a “tradition” in Moldova as the woman that Kara interviewed would argue. However, Moldova is not the only country that condones violence against women. Albania also is quite oppressive. A large part of this doubtlessly originates from the “Kanun,” a code written by a Lekë Dukagjini, a fifteenth century Albanian feudal lord. In this Kanun (or “code”), there are many provisions for preserving one’s honor, a thing of paramount importance in Albanian culture.

There are also many passages describing the subjection of women under men’s domination. “The blood of woman is not equal to the blood of a man. A woman is known as a sack, made to endure.”⁷⁹ Men have very few obligations in this Kanun, whereas women have many, and there are severe punishments for not meeting them. I will provide a more in-depth exploration of the Kanun in a later case study.

Indian Caste System

The enduring influence of the Indian caste and bonded labor system cannot be underestimated. Bonded labor in India is a vast and long-lasting practice that stretches all the way back to the ancients.⁸⁰ Debt incurred by a father can be handed down to a son born into debt which can subsequently be handed down to his sons. It is very much a part of the Indian culture to allow bonded labor to exist and fighting it will likely prove problematic.

Estimating the extensiveness of the bonded labor in India is difficult because the estimates produced by the Indian government are notoriously skewed. Some Indian states insist no bonded labor exists within their borders despite documented evidence to the contrary.⁸¹ It is

⁷⁹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 129

⁸⁰Bales, *Disposable People*, 197

⁸¹Bales, *Disposable People*, 198

suspected that the numbers are in the millions, but how many millions, 2, 10, 20 million is not known.⁸²

One problem with identifying Indian bonded labor is the sheer size of India's population and the enormous variety within this population. There are approximately one billion living within India with over one thousand languages being spoken and about six hundred recognized tribes.⁸³ With that being the case, there exists great variation upon bonded labor in India. Some debt bondage is passed from child to parent.⁸⁴ In other locations, a family may give a child over into bondage for agricultural work or as a domestic servant.⁸⁵ Other forms of slavery have been described as feudalism where the workers are forced to remain on the master's land and work it.⁸⁶

The Indian caste system is ordered into five categories; the *Brahmins* (priests and teachers), the *Ksyatriyas* (rulers and soldiers), the *Vaisyas* (merchants and traders), and the *Shudras* (laborers and artisans) and finally the "untouchables" or Dalits.⁸⁷ Dalits are often assigned tasks too ritually polluting to merit inclusion within the traditional varna system.⁸⁸ The Dalits are deemed so filthy that they are not even included into the regular varnas or large caste systems.⁸⁹ When children are sold into slavery, oftentimes it is Dalit children.⁹⁰

⁸²Bales, *Disposable People*, 198

⁸³Bales, *Disposable People*, 198

⁸⁴Bales, *Disposable People*, 198

⁸⁵Bales, *Disposable People*, 198

⁸⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 199

⁸⁷Human Rights Watch for the United Nations World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance. Durban, South Africa, September 2001, "Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern" URL: <<http://www.hrw.org/reports/2001/globalcaste/caste0801-03.htm>>, accessed February 13, 2015

⁸⁸Human Rights Watch, "Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern"

⁸⁹Human Rights Watch, "Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern"

⁹⁰Human Rights Watch, "Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern"

Though India outlawed discrimination by caste system in 1950, it is still very much a part of rural Indian life.⁹¹ This situation creates great opportunities for traffickers.

In 1999, a cyclone pummeled the eastern coast of India near Orissa, killing thousands. In the ensuing clean up, the Indian government was forced to bring in hundreds of Dalits to haul away animal carcasses because the local inhabitants refused, believing that removing decayed animals was work delegated to Dalits and that they still had “some self-respect left.”⁹² Even during a time of disaster, the traditional division of labor in India remains intact.

With such a long, largely-accepted tradition of discrimination and willingness to tread upon a class of people, India is a prime example of a culture that created a good opportunity for exploitation and slavery. With the pool of possible labor present to exploit, and tradition seemingly backing the act, it does not appear that bonded labor will disappear from India any time soon especially with the extensiveness of poverty in this region.

Heritage of Slavery (Mauritania)

Nowhere in the world is slavery so prevalent as it is in Mauritania nor is the cultural acceptance of the practice so high. The region is bereft of enough natural resources to exploit to sustain itself, so the most durable and profitable commodity has always been slaves.⁹³ The roots of this acceptance goes far back in history to the ancients when the Moors captured slaves in southern Mauritania and transported them to Rome.⁹⁴ Africans, enslaved for generations by their Muslim masters or “White Moors,” exist in this system that demands all their labor for nothing. Here, great value is placed upon the bodies and lives of slaves making this form of slavery more “humane” than other kinds of slavery and also more ingrained in

⁹¹Human Rights Watch, “Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern”

⁹²Human Rights Watch, “Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern”

⁹³Bales, *Disposable People*, 83

⁹⁴Bales, *Disposable People*, 83

the mind of master and slave alike.⁹⁵ It is this high level of acceptance that has allowed this ancient form of slavery to survive with very little violence.⁹⁶ It is this lack of violence that allows it to thrive without outsiders noticing it.⁹⁷

Slaves are inherited, and new masters who inherit slaves often think of them as children.⁹⁸ Indeed, slaves often think of themselves as members of their master's family and as Muslims, they believe they are placed in their master's house and to leave it would be sinful.⁹⁹ As for the masters, they, for the most part, believe they have a responsibility to their slaves.¹⁰⁰ Though the slaves are worked hard, they are often cared for when they are old and their usefulness has worn out, defying the new form of slavery that disposes of slaves in a short amount of time when they are no longer useful.

Mauritania banished slavery in the 1980s, but this did not result in slaves being freed in practice. Many slaves do not even know they were liberated. This is not likely to change any time soon because the government keeps a tight grip upon the country's interactions with the outside world.¹⁰¹ Even if a slave were to escape or by some luck achieve freedom, there is next to no way for a former slave to support himself/herself in Mauritania.

Religion

Many religions endorse peace, wholeness, and connectedness to society and fellow man. However, there are also parts of religion that lay the groundwork for strife, hatred, and justify some of the worst forms of human trafficking. Here will be presented a few religions

⁹⁵Bales, *Disposable People*, 83

⁹⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 83

⁹⁷Bales, *Disposable People*, 83

⁹⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 84

⁹⁹Bales, *Disposable People*, 84

¹⁰⁰Bales, *Disposable People*, 85

¹⁰¹Bales, *Disposable People*, 88

that empower human trafficking the most and/or lend credence to future case studies later in this thesis.

Sharia Law

The Quran is the foundation of Sharia Law and does not condone sustaining slavery, but it also was written during a time when slavery was an accepted norm.¹⁰² Slavery in Africa was already a deeply-rooted and organized institution by the time the Europeans arrived.¹⁰³ Muslims justified the enslavement of Africans by Sharia Law which teaches that *kufirs*, or nonbelieving Muslims, and *kuffars*, nonbelieving non-Muslims, could be enslaved.¹⁰⁴ Nonbelievers, according to Sharia Law, are essentially dragged to heaven because they are slaves to the believing Muslims.¹⁰⁵ Groups like ISIS seize upon this to justify their actions. Slavery also became a matter of race and skin color to the Muslims in Africa who used a tradition of associating the descendants of Ham with those with black skin.¹⁰⁶ According to this tradition, the sons of Ham will always serve the descendants of the other sons of Noah when they meet. Therefore, being black meant to be a slave.

Mecca became the center of the global slave trade for centuries and remained so into the 20th century. From Mecca, the slaves were distributed all over Arabia and the world.¹⁰⁷ Even after the British abolished slavery, Muslims were allowed to keep slaves on religious

¹⁰²Bernard Freamon, “ISIS says Islam justifies slavery - what does Islamic law say?” *CNN*, November 5, 2014, URL: <<http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2014/11/05/isis-says-islam-justifies-slavery-what-does-islamic-law-say/>>, accessed January 18, 2015

¹⁰³John Alembillah Azumah, *The Legacy of Arab-Islam in Africa: A Quest for Inter-Religious Dialogue* (London, England: Oneworld Publications, 2014), 117

¹⁰⁴Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 125

¹⁰⁵Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 128

¹⁰⁶Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 128

¹⁰⁷Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 146

grounds.¹⁰⁸ Inflicting bodily harm upon a slave resulted in no punishment upon the master unless it was done for a non-just reason would atonement be required.¹⁰⁹ That being said, Muslims usually had an incentive to treat their slaves as well as they would a horse from which they needed to obtain labor.¹¹⁰

The ancient traditions of Islam is relevant today for a few reasons. First, radical Muslims wishing to follow Sharia Law interpret sections of the Quran literally. By Sharia Law, radical Muslims like al-Qaeda justify enslaving those whom they conquer. What makes Sharia Law unique is that it does not allow for political participation of nonbelievers, nor are nonbelievers equal before the law with Muslims.¹¹¹ Also, Sharia Law teaches that it is not good enough to simply follow the teachings of the Quran, but they must also compel others to do the same.¹¹² This is accomplished through jihad which creates the perfect justification for conflict.

Justification of modern slavery can be found in the teachings of Jihad. According to David Cook of Rice University, Jihad was first and foremost a military action, and the concept of “peaceful jihad” where a devout Muslim wages war upon internal distractions that keep him from pursuing God came after that.¹¹³ Though peace is prized in the Quran, it is assumed that it will be a peace with Muslim domination because enduring peace and harmony is only achieved by complete submission to Allah.¹¹⁴

Buddhism/Asian Religion

¹⁰⁸Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 154

¹⁰⁹Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 165

¹¹⁰Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 167

¹¹¹Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 201

¹¹²Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 203

¹¹³Richard L. Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide* (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2010), 12

¹¹⁴Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 13

Asian cultures, such as Thailand, have a tendency to hold women as inferior to men. This goes back to the tenets of Buddhism, which teach that women are inferior to men. For instance, in Thailand the particular form of Buddhism practiced says that women cannot obtain enlightenment, the ultimate goal of Buddhism.¹¹⁵ The best thing women can hope for is to live a virtuous life that will allow them to be reincarnated as a man.¹¹⁶ Being a woman in Thailand may actually be a form of punishment for actions committed in a past life.¹¹⁷

Girls in India can be “married” to a god, meaning she will reside in the temple, never marry, never leave and will be under the control of the men who run the temple.¹¹⁸ The girl’s family is often poor and attempting to appease local gods and win fortune.¹¹⁹ Often, these girls are turned into prostitutes who reap a great deal of money for their masters in the temple.¹²⁰

Voodoo

Voodoo in African countries can be used as a way to bind women to their fate as slaves. Voodoo rituals known as “juju” are used to instill fear into young women and discourage them from communicating with police. This is accomplished by forcing the girls to take voodoo rites before departing their country in which they swear not to attempt escape or to contact the police.¹²¹ If they break their oaths, great misfortune will befall them and their family.¹²² This approach appears to be so effective that Italian police have noted that

¹¹⁵Bales, *Disposable People*, 38

¹¹⁶Bales, *Disposable People*, 38

¹¹⁷Bales, *Disposable People*, 38

¹¹⁸Bales, *Disposable People*, 199

¹¹⁹Bales, *Disposable People*, 199

¹²⁰Bales, *Disposable People*, 199

¹²¹Alexis A. Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking: Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009), 60

¹²²Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 60

Nigerians very rarely testify against their exploiters, regardless of the severity of their slavery.¹²³

Conclusion

There are many factors that create an environment conducive for human trafficking. Some are economic and action can be taken to alleviate them. Others, such as cultural or religious practices within countries, will require sweeping adjustments on a profound level. The chances of adjusting ancient cultures and religions, like the Indian caste system which officially does not exist already, appear slim indeed. However, those trying to understand modern slavery must grasp the conditions within which it operates in order to predict how it will be utilized by our enemies in organized crime, terrorist groups, and rogue nations.

¹²³Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 60

Chapter Three: ISIS

Human Trafficking Used by a Terrorist Group

Modern slavery has only minor significance to military and political strategists as long as there is no link between human trafficking and our enemies. Terrorist organizations are one of the most visible enemies of the U.S. and they use human trafficking as a way to fund themselves. Terrorist groups vary in their vision, what they are willing to do, and the level of hostility directed against the U.S. The Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) is perhaps the most recognized terrorist group in the news in 2015. It has become known for its level of brutality and pointed threats against the U.S. and has also become an example to other terrorist organizations. Boko Haram, which operates in Nigeria, has expressed its admiration for the methods of ISIS and has attempted to emulate the organization.¹

As a result of the Syrian civil war which ISIS has prolonged, 7.6 million women have been displaced internally within Syria with 3.2 million being displaced abroad according to the United Nation's Population Fund.² The UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights reported that ISIS has enslaved and sexually assaulted over 25,000 women and children.³ For this reason, this thesis will examine the ways in which ISIS uses modern slavery to strengthen itself. There are three ways in which ISIS uses modern slavery to wage

¹Louise Shelley, "ISIS, Boko Haram, and the Growing Role of Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism" *Daily Beast*, December 26, 2014, URL: <<http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2014/12/26/isis-boko-haram-and-the-growing-role-of-human-trafficking-in-21st-century-terrorism.html>>, accessed January 10, 2015

²United Nations Population Fund, *Regional Situation Report for Syria Crisis #27 - November 2014*, November 2014, URL: <<http://www.unfpa.org/resources/regional-situation-report-syria-crisis-27-november-2014>>, accessed January 10, 2015

³Samuel Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs from Bodies of Kidnapped Captives, Dead Soldiers and Injured Prisoners, Mosul Doctor Says" *The Christian Post*, December 8, 2014, URL: <<http://www.christianpost.com/news/isis-trafficking-human-organs-from-bodies-of-kidnapped-captives-dead-soldiers-and-injured-prisoners-mosul-doctor-says-130842/>>, accessed January 9, 2015

their jihad; 1) as a revenue source 2) as a recruitment tool, and 3) as a way to vanquish their foes.⁴ Each of these deserve closer examination.

Modern Slavery as a Source of Revenue

The exact financial situation of ISIS is difficult to uncover, but we do know the organization uses a wide variety of methods to generate income. According to Mathew Levit, from the Washington Institute for Near East Policy, ISIS is the best financed terrorist group to date, saying, “They will always fund themselves through domestic criminal activity within the borders of Iraq.”⁵ Essentially, it is large organized crime without law enforcement to curtail it.⁶

It has been estimated that ISIS is worth \$2 billion annually due to its activities in oil production, drug smuggling, and human trafficking.⁷ Interestingly enough, ISIS sells the oil it makes back to President Bashar al-Assad’s regime. They both want the rebels destroyed, so ISIS and Assad appear to have at least a temporary cooperating relationship.⁸ Just how much human trafficking helps ISIS in funding their operations is questionable because they obtain millions of dollars on a daily basis by controlling oil wells⁹ and sell women and children from captured areas for as little as \$25.¹⁰ However, it can also be argued that prices for women are so low because there are many slaves from newly conquered territory, thus making up the difference and creating a very lucrative trade in human beings.

⁴Shelley, “Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism”

⁵Ashley Fantz “How ISIS makes (and takes) money” *CNN*, February 19, 2015, URL: <http://www.cnn.com/2015/02/19/world/how-isis-makes-money/>, accessed March 3, 2015

⁶Fantz, “How ISIS makes (and takes) money”

⁷Smith, “ISIS Trafficking Human Organs”

⁸Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2870

⁹Shelley, “Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism”

¹⁰Shelley, “Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism”

These women and children come from religious minorities, like the the Yazidi, in the regions that they conquer. According to an article in ISIS's *Dabiq* magazine, a fifth of the slaves taken by ISIS are to be given over to the power of the state as a tax known as the "khums" tax, adding to the group's income.¹¹ There is a more sinister form of human trafficking that ISIS is alleged to be engaged in that could generate a significant amount of income: organ trafficking.

Organ Trafficking

Organ trafficking, as discussed earlier, is a very lucrative trade with a high demand and a large pool of poor victims to draw from either by coercion or deception. ISIS seems to have adapted this practice for its own uses, according to firsthand reports from individuals in the region. It is difficult to say how much credence to give the accounts or if they should be labeled as propaganda to galvanize the public even further against ISIS. However, these accounts should be revealed and evaluated because, if true, organ trafficking is a tool of our enemy and provides us an opportunity to strike at their funding.

Dr. Siruwan al-Mosuli reported in an article in the Christian Post that he believed ISIS was using a hospital to harvest organs from dead militants who fought ISIS.¹² The bodies, he reports, are quickly transported to the hospital where their valuable organs are removed. Also, he reports that kidnapped individuals or injured captives are also killed and their organs taken and sold to fund the spread of Sharia Law in the region.¹³ Dr. al-Mosuli

¹¹"The Revival of Slavery before the Hour" *Dabiq*, fourth issue, July 2014, retrieved from the Clarion Project, URL: <<http://www.clarionproject.org/news/islamic-state-isis-isil-propaganda-magazine-dabiq>>, accessed January 20, 2015, 15

¹²Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

¹³Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

says he became suspicious when foreign doctors were brought into the hospital and were not allowed to mingle with the other doctors in the hospital.¹⁴

Iraq's ambassador to the United Nations, Mohamed Alhakim, recently reported to the UN Security Council that graves had been dug up in Iraq and that the kidneys of the bodies removed.¹⁵ Alhakim attributed these grave robberies to ISIS. However, it is not verified if these reports are true according to Britain's UN ambassador Mark Lyall Grant.¹⁶ It may be that this is a fabricated story to further demonize ISIS, though it does not seem that the truth from other stories could be worse. However, this testimony appears to be corroborated by the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights that reported that ISIS sells the organs of injured individuals.¹⁷

This report implies an intricate operation requiring coordination between other hospitals in locations like Saudi Arabia and Turkey.¹⁸ As mentioned before, organ trafficking usually requires a specialized mafia that focuses exclusively upon this trade.¹⁹ It requires an intricate connection to external organ transportation networks²⁰, without which ISIS could not operate or get their organs to hospitals that accept their harvested organs either knowingly or unknowingly of their procurement. The exact amount of funding obtained by this method of extortion is not known, but it can be assumed by looking at recent information for organ trafficking that it is quite lucrative.

¹⁴Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

¹⁵Ray Sanchez, "United Nations investigates claim of ISIS organ theft" *CNN*, February 19, 2015, URL: <<http://www.cnn.com/2015/02/18/middleeast/isis-organ-harvesting-claim/>>, accessed March 3, 2015

¹⁶Sanchez, "ISIS organ theft"

¹⁷Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

¹⁸Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

¹⁹Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

²⁰Smith, "ISIS Trafficking Human Organs"

Modern Slavery Used as Fighting Power

ISIS has utilized slavery as a way to increase their fighting power by using slavery as an incentive to young men to join. These men are among the teeming throng of youths in the developing world who do not have work to empower themselves and improve their lives. They are disenfranchised from the global system. As such, many of them are powerless to change their fates without using violence. When ISIS entered the picture with the promise of both material and spiritual rewards from jihad, this appeared to be an appealing alternative. Holding power over women, then, becomes a recruiting tool.

Because ISIS uses examples from ancient warfare to justify their actions, it is little wonder they consider enslaving prisoners justified. However, it would be misleading to say ISIS views women as nothing more than objects to fulfill carnal desires as sexual slaves. ISIS also seeks to incorporate women into their holy war by providing those who have joined with recipes for pancakes and other dishes that can be prepared for the fighting men. Zora Foundation, the group's propaganda network, says the dishes, "contain significant calories and will extend the power and strength of the Mujahedeen, God willing."²¹ Women are not allowed to fight, but they are allowed to do more feminine work which consists of sewing and creating online propaganda.²² This bizarre angle to terrorism, normalizing the holy war

²¹Louise Cheer, "Up to 40 Australian 'jihadi brides' have been recruited by Islamic State to partner with soldiers fighting in Syria... despite being used as sex slaves and suicide bombers" *Dailymail.com*, February 25, 2015, URL: <<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2969277/Up-40-Australian-jihadi-brides-recruited-ISIS-partner-soldiers-fighting-Syria-despite-used-sex-slaves-suicide-bombers.html>>, accessed March 12, 2015

²²Homa Khaleeli, "Domestic Terrorism; housewives taught how to provide battle snacks" *The Guardian*, November 5, 2014, URL: <<http://www.theguardian.com/world/shortcuts/2014/nov/05/isis-housewives-told-to-prepare-battle-snacks>>, January 14, 2015

to the point that it appears as normal as cooking your next meal, is not available to non-Muslims who have been captured by ISIS.

ISIS justifies the practice of slavery by the teachings of Sharia Law so much that they recently posted a pamphlet called “Questions and Answers on Female Slaves and Their Freedom” in Mosul, Iraq after wresting control of it.²³ This pamphlet is arranged in Q&A format, laying out exactly what rights ISIS members have to enslave women and girls from the population and explains the few rights that women have in this process. For example, slaves can buy their own freedom or an owner can release a slave for a sin.²⁴ It is worth noting, however, that releasing slaves is not the only method to atone for sins. A devout Muslim can also fast or feed the hungry.²⁵ When given such options, it seems unlikely that choosing to release a slave, a symbol of status within this sub-culture, would be the favored path to atone for a sin.

Obviously, the majority of the power in this relationship goes to the members of ISIS who have enslaved women and children and the rules reflect that reality. It is permissible to have sexual intercourse with virgins if she is considered old enough, something arbitrarily decided.²⁶ It is permissible to separate mothers from their children, though impregnated women cannot be sold.²⁷ If women or children do not submit, ISIS members are permitted to

²³Greg Botelho, “ISIS; Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK” *CNN*, December 13, 2014, URL: <http://www.cnn.com/2014/12/12/world/meast/isis-justification-female-slaves/>, accessed January 15, 2015

²⁴Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

²⁵Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

²⁶Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

²⁷Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

beat them as long as it is not for pleasure and it does not become torture.²⁸ Again, the working definition for “torture” in this context is vague and defies definition.

Perhaps the most telling sentence in the pamphlet is “It is permissible to buy, sell or give as a gift female captives and slaves, for *they are merely property* [emphasis added]”²⁹ This sentence harkens back to ancient times in Islam when slavery was a formalized and deep-seated practice. This fits into the identity of ISIS as bringing back what they perceive as the old days of Islam under Sharia Law. Of course, the citizens of Mosul are understandably not pleased with this turn of events. However, what are their options? ISIS has already shown they are quite willing to use violence against those who resist them. To resist, or to not zealously support them enough, earns the unfortunate person a position on ISIS’s enemy list, which is quite extensive.

Like militant groups in Africa, ISIS also recruits children. In Raqqa, in north central Syria, for instance, ISIS takes advantage of the poor, illiterate families in this war-torn area by providing food and money to families of children who fight with them. According to a witness in Raqqa who has stringently protested ISIS at the risk of her life, “They [ISIS] elevate these kids and call them sheikhs, and give them weapons and power, turn them into child soldiers. But these are ten-year-olds who have never studied theology, and now they’re sheikhs!”³⁰

If used as part of a large effort to recruit younger children, this could pose quite a quandary for defeating ISIS because of the complications presented when children become

²⁸Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

²⁹Botelho, “Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK”

³⁰Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2722

soldiers. These children will be easier to mold into vessels for Jihad than most adults, and the presence of child soldiers will prolong the war in the Middle East, like it has in Africa.

As a Way to Vanquish Their Foes

Those who are not Muslim, or who resist their particular brand of Islam, are treated as enemies of Allah and therefore subhuman. Targeting members of a community, like the Yazidi, is an ideal way for ISIS to decimate a community.³¹ Perhaps this is the most useful way that ISIS can use modern slavery to further their objectives; demoralizing their enemies.³² There is evidence of this strategy being systemically applied towards minorities in areas that ISIS has conquered.

Since early August, 2014, this group has made it a point of using young girls and women as spoils of war, and these girls and women usually come from the Yazidi ethnic group. The Yazidi religion is a mix of Islam, Judaism, and Zoroastrianism in northern Iraq.³³ Regardless of the strains of Islam in their religion, ISIS considers them devil-worshippers who deserve to be enslaved.³⁴ Upwards of 7000 Yazidi girls and women have disappeared in the past months and it is widely believed by experts like Matthew Barber, a scholar from Chicago who was working in Iraqi Kurdistan in the summer of 2014, that they are being used as slaves for the fighters of ISIS.³⁵ Roughly 300 girls and women have escaped from ISIS

³¹Shelley, "Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism"

³²Shelley, "Human Trafficking in 21st Century Terrorism"

³³Kirk Semple, "Yazidi Girls Seized by ISIS Speak Out After Escape" *The New York Times*, November 14, 2014, URL: <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/11/15/world/middleeast/yazidi-girls-seized-by-isis-speak-out-after-escape.html?_r=0>, accessed December 8, 2015

³⁴"The Revival of Slavery before the Hour" *Dabiq*, 14

³⁵Matthew Barber, "Freeing Yazidi Women: Combating a 21st Century Slavery Revival Project" October 31, 2014, (presentation at the Middle East Program of the Woodrow Wilson Center, Chicago), URL: <<http://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/freeing->

thus far, according to Donatella Rovera, Amnesty International's Senior Crisis Response Advisor. Rovera also reported that most of the girls were children 14, 15 or younger.³⁶

ISIS has gone to great lengths to target the Yazidi. It has displaced 130,000 Yazidi with many abandoning their livelihoods and being forced to join refugee camps.³⁷ In August of 2014, ISIS surrounded Jebel Sinjair in Iraq and the Yazidi that took refuge there.

According to a report by the UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, anywhere from 35,000-50,000 Yazidi were trapped on the mountain.³⁸ ISIS's siege has since been broken, but ISIS has not stopped targeting the Yazidi.

Members of ISIS taunted the Yazidi trapped on the mountain, sending text messages such as the one below. The recipient shared it with "Al Jazeera", a global news outlet:

"'Where are you going to go? I swear [to] God I will cut you into pieces... We are coming for you, you pig, you enemy of God,'" read a text message that Qassim showed Al Jazeera on his cell phone. He said the message came from a member [of ISIS] "'Didn't I tell you yesterday to come and repent?'"³⁹

yazidi-women-combating-21st-century-slavery-revival-project>, accessed December 27, 2014

³⁶Amnesty International, "Escape from Hell: Torture and Sexual Slavery in Islamic State Captivity in Iraq", December 2014, URL: <<http://www.dw.de/amnesty-international-report-yazidi-women-and-girls-face-islamic-state-sexual-violence/a-18147468>>, February 2015

³⁷"Displaced Yazidis in dire need of help, UN warns" *Daily Sabah*, January 26, 2015, URL: <<http://www.dailysabah.com/mideast/2015/01/26/displaced-yazidis-in-dire-need-of-help-un-warns>>, accessed February 28, 2015

³⁸UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs "OCHA Flash Update: Iraq Crisis - Significant Displacement from Sinjar, No. 2 | 4 August 2014" August 4, 2014, retrieved from *Reliefweb*, URL: <<http://reliefweb.int/report/iraq/ocha-flash-update-iraq-crisis-significant-displacement-sinjar-no-2-4-august-2014>>, accessed February 17, 2015

³⁹Mohammed A Salih , Wladimir van Wilgenburg, "Iraqi Yazidis: 'If we move they will kill us'" *Aljazeera*, August 5, 2014, URL: <<http://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2014/08/iraqi-yazidis-if-move-they-will-kill-us-20148513656188206.html>>, accessed February 8, 2015

Yazidi girls are given to ISIS fighters as rewards for their services. Recipients then have the option to trade the women or take them as wives or concubines.⁴⁰ These “wives” or “concubines” are forced to convert to Islam and then are considered the property of the man who owns them. Concubines serve an important part in the lives of Muslims wishing to follow traditional laws. The motive for this can also be attributed to the rules of Sharia Law in which the members of ISIS believe that having sexual relations with a “concubine” is perfectly legal. They can be resold many times, and women and girls can often be sold across the border to Syria.⁴¹

The Yazidi are particularly vulnerable to ISIS because they are not protected as a minority. Indeed, fleeing Christians from Mosul were given more protection than the Yazidi.⁴² Even Christians and Jews are allowed to pay a fee to protect themselves (a *jizyah*) but Yazidis are not.⁴³ *Dabiq* claims that ISIS’s scholars conducted thorough research to ascertain if the Yazidi were in fact Muslims who later apostatized or are “mushriks,” or polytheists and therefore pagans.⁴⁴ It was decided that the Yazidi are “mushriks.” According to Barber, the way in which ISIS systematically targeted Yazidi women is proof that ISIS is launching itself into “the 21st century slavery project.”⁴⁵

Perhaps the most remarkable aspect of the enslavement of unbelievers is the ferocity with which ISIS defends its stance on this practice. The editors of *Dabiq* emphasize the importance of slavery so much that they call the introduction of sex slavery as a sign of “The

⁴⁰ Semple, “Yazidi Girls Seized by ISIS Speak Out”

⁴¹ Semple, “Yazidi Girls Seized by ISIS Speak Out”

⁴² Barber, “Freeing Yazidi Women”

⁴³ “The Revival of Slavery before the Hour” *Dabiq*, 15

⁴⁴ “The Revival of Slavery before the Hour” *Dabiq*, 15

⁴⁵ Barber, “Freeing Yazidi Women”

Hour” or the Judgment Day.⁴⁶ According to a hadith, the apocalypse will come when a “slave gives birth to her master.”⁴⁷

According to Dabiq, “...enslaving the families of the kuffār [disbelievers] and taking their women as concubines is a firmly established aspect of the Sharī’ah that if one were to deny or mock, he would be denying or mocking the verses of the Qur’ān and the narrations of the Prophet... and thereby apostatizing from Islam.”⁴⁸

ISIS takes this a step further by saying that abandoning slavery has hurt faithful Muslims.

“Finally, a number of contemporary scholars have mentioned that the desertion of slavery had led to an increase in fāhishah (adultery, fornication, etc.), because the shar’ī alternative to marriage is not available, so a man who cannot afford marriage to a free woman finds himself surrounded by temptation towards sin.”⁴⁹

Justification

ISIS’s justification for using slavery as a weapon originates from its interpretation of the Quran and Salafism, or the desire for theological purity and a return to the teachings of the Prophet.⁵⁰ Luckily, there is no need to guess at their position of slavery because they write quite clearly about it in *Dabiq* and in pamphlets like what it distributed in Mosul. The concept of slavery is firmly established in the minds of ISIS fighters and this perception, and their violence towards their “enemies” originates in their interpretation of Sharia Law and the Quran.

⁴⁶Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2558

⁴⁷Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2558

⁴⁸“The Revival of Slavery before the Hour” *Dabiq*, 15

⁴⁹“The Revival of Slavery before the Hour” *Dabiq*, 17

⁵⁰Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 183

ISIS point to the Massacre of Banu Qurayzah, where Muhammad conquered a city and killed those who did not submit and enslaved their women and children,⁵¹ as a model for them to follow. It is worth noting, however, that this practice would have been common in the time of “The Prophet” regardless of whether the conquerors were Muslim or not. However, it has been used as a model for how to deal with infidels and overcome *jahiliyya*, or the state of ignorance of the guidance of God.⁵²

According to the radical interpretation of Islam that ISIS embraces, there is no tolerance for those who do not believe as they do. The world is divided among dar-al Islam and dar-al harbarb – those who believe and those who do not believe, respectively. While the Quran preaches peace, it is understood that peace is to be achieved only under Islamic rule. If a religious minority wishes, it can become a dhimmis, a protected religious minority under Islamic rule.⁵³ However, the level of “tolerance” that the rulers must give to the dhimmis is not specified and can range anywhere from humiliating the minority to outright murder, rape, and enslavement.⁵⁴

However, it is worth noting that no penalty is meted out to Muslim perpetrators.⁵⁵ Though ISIS has used the teachings of the Quran to justify their actions, many clerics of Islam have also condemned them by the Quran as well.⁵⁶ I will not attempt to discern who best represents Islam here; I merely aim to analyze how our enemies interpret the Quran and

⁵¹Richard L. Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide* (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2010), 15

⁵²Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 15

⁵³Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 17

⁵⁴Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 21

⁵⁵Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 21

⁵⁶Bernard Freamon, “ISIS says Islam justifies slavery - what does Islamic law say?” *CNN*, November 5, 2014, URL:

<<http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2014/11/05/isis-says-islam-justifies-slavery-what-does-islamic-law-say/>>, accessed January 18, 2015

what its implications are for the U.S. and modern slavery. There are Muslims seeking peaceful relations with nonbelievers but they have a difficult time justifying this approach from Islamic traditions that call for jihad and enslavement.⁵⁷ Their counterparts, however, the revisionists like ISIS, do not share the same handicap.⁵⁸ However, other scholars like Professor Bernard Freamon argue that ISIS uses only selected passages of the Quran to justify their actions and ignore the fact that there is no passage talking about the continuation of slavery and that when mentioned it is often in the context of liberating slaves.⁵⁹

According to Sayyid Qutb, a revered founder of modern jihad, having respect for life is a sign of materialism and *jahiliyya* and therefore is not desired.⁶⁰ Richard Rubenstein, author of *Jihad and Genocide*, says radical Islamists believe the value of life is based upon the mistaken concept that mortal life is to be valued.⁶¹ Hence, “At this point, savagery and chaos begin and these regions start to suffer from the lack of security.”⁶²

Those in ISIS talk about how persuasive the members are going so far as to say that if a member of ISIS talks to you for an hour, you will be convinced of the group’s cause and justice.⁶³ Even those being prosecuted attest to the level of persuasion of ISIS.⁶⁴ Even those who view ISIS as a band of illiterate thugs, like Abu Bilal al-Layli who is on ISIS’s wanted list after they burned down his house, admire that they can persuade unreligious people to join a cause against “thieves” and instill in them a longing for someone to fight.⁶⁵

⁵⁷ Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 202

⁵⁸ Azumah, *Arab-Islam in Africa*, 202

⁵⁹ Freamon, “ISIS says Islam justifies slavery - what does Islamic law say?”

⁶⁰ Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 21

⁶¹ Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 23

⁶² Rubenstein, *Jihad and Genocide*, 23

⁶³ Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2270

⁶⁴ Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2270

⁶⁵ Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2270

ISIS's ability to recruit among unlearned audiences is unsettling because it offers the organization a large pool from which to draw. It will be difficult for future military campaigns to win hearts and minds if ISIS has that ability so finely honed among the disenfranchised segments of the population. ISIS has also (for the time being anyway) managed to provide basic necessities like food delivery and sanitation in communities it controls.⁶⁶ In regions torn by civil war, this societal order is considered a blessing by some, even with the draconian rules.⁶⁷ However, it is unlikely that populations under ISIS's control will remain docile for long after ISIS enforces its Sharia Law.

Conclusion

Slavery is not a new concept for ISIS. It is not a modern creation but instead harkens back to the days of Mohammed and is used as a weapon against their enemies while being improved by modern globalization. Instead of simply being a means to an end, enslaving their enemies is a core aspect of the Islamic State's identity. According to *Dabiq*, "Soon, by Allah's permission, a day will come when the Muslim will walk everywhere as a master, having honor, being revered, with head raised high and his dignity preserved. Anyone who dares to offend him will be disciplined, and any hand that reaches out to harm him will be cut off."⁶⁸

Such language indicates that instead of slavery used simply as a tool by ISIS to further their goals, they intend to be rulers of their subjects as masters. So, in the Middle East, we see human trafficking and modern slavery being used as both an ends and a means to that end in the strategy of a sworn enemy of the U.S. and the west. There is no middle

⁶⁶Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2392

⁶⁷Weiss, Hassan, *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror*, location 2392

⁶⁸"A New Era Has Arrived of Might and Dignity for the Muslims" *Dabiq*, July 2014, Issue 1 (The Return of Khilafah), 8

ground in their stance because the world is divided into two camps, that of Mujahidin Muslims and the camp of Jews, crusaders and their allies and the rest of the false religions.⁶⁹ It appears that the Muslim talked about in *Dabiq* cannot hold their head high at the same time as the “unbelievers” because their freedom comes at the cost of the Muslims.

Attacking slavery in this part of the world, then, will not only provide an opportunity to attack ISIS’ ability to recruit, sustain itself and subjugate their foes but also strike at the very heart of ISIS’ identity. They describe themselves as masters ruling over obedient subjects and those who join do so partly with the incentive of acquiring slaves. As with all slave cultures in the past, it is likely that acquiring a large number of slaves will become an indication of prestige.

The methods by which ISIS has used modern slavery to its advantage are not confined to the topics covered in this case study. There are still questions I fear will go unanswered until intelligence operatives have the opportunity to fully reconnoiter the situation. There are things the author would like to know. For example, what percentage of the work performed in ISIS-controlled regions are by slaves? What becomes of the one fifth of the slaves that the Islamic State claims for itself before splitting the rest of the spoils with its fighters? Are they sent abroad as forced labor, much like North Korea does with its citizens? Are they sold into bondage for organized crime groups? If they are sold into slavery and the revenue from their sale goes to ISIS, who are the buyers? Such questions, unfortunately, are not likely to be answered until such information becomes more widely accessed by the public.

⁶⁹“A New Era Has Arrived” *Dabiq*, 8

Until law and order brought about by a political process takes place in Syria and Iraq, exploitation will continue. According to Manal Omar, Associate Vice President of the Center for the Middle East and Africa at the U.S. Institute of Peace, “Those who rape and violate women in Syria do so by taking advantage of certain social taboos that make it difficult for women to talk about what happened to them. They fear being ostracized by their communities or even by their families. In areas controlled by religious extremists, women who are violated also fear for their lives, as being sentenced to death is a possible consequence for being forced to participate in certain sexual acts. These possibilities are a form of social control that can be leveraged during chaotic situations like the one in Syria right now. Sexual assault is not an accidental consequence of war, but a strategy for control.”⁷⁰

⁷⁰Manal Omar, “The Women in the Middle of the War” *Foreign Policy* online edition, March 18, 2015, URL: <http://foreignpolicy.com/2015/03/18/the-women-in-the-middle-of-the-war/?utm_content=bufferbf2fb&utm_medium=social&utm_source=facebook.com&utm_campaign=buffer>, accessed March 19, 2015

Chapter 4: The Albanians

Human Trafficking Used by Organized Crime

According to German Prosecutor Leo Keidel, “Human trafficking is, without a doubt, a major branch of organized crime.”¹ By exploiting women and children from the Balkans to work in brothels and as prostitutes throughout Europe and the world, the Albanians have gained a certain level of prestige in the organized crime world and sparked the debate about how much of a transnational threat they pose.

Made famous by the movie *Taken*, Albanian organized crime groups have lived up to their reputation of being willing to use brutality to achieve their objectives. Due to their ability to intimidate, they have managed to gain influence in areas as far-flung from the Balkans as London and New York City. Human trafficking provides an easy source of income for this brand of organized crime by offering very little risk of retribution in exchange for enormous rewards.

Though the Albanians and ISIS are similar in their willingness to use violence, they differ in a few fundamental ways. First, factors such as globalization and transnational crime are perhaps more relevant to this form of human trafficking than it is in the small, localized area of Syria and Iraq. Though victims move about in the Middle East, they are not transported around the world to meet the demands of clients. Second, Albanian crime groups are not motivated from a divine vision of a religious state. There is not a religious aspect to the Albanian form of enslavement, though there are market forces. The Albanians follow a general pattern of other organized crime groups that have participated in human trafficking;

¹Sally Stoecker, “The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime” (*Demokratizatsiya*, Vol. 8, No. 1, Winter 2000), 130

they thrive in areas with poor economic and employment prospects for women, organized extant criminal organizations, and a culture that subordinates the role of women in society.²

Scope of the Albanian Influence

The Albanians have gone from performing work for other groups to reaching the highest level of international crime.³ An Italian prosecutor said, “Albanian organized crime has become the point of reference for all criminal activity today. Everything passes via the Albanians.”⁴ As an example, of the heroin that is seized by the police in Europe, 70-90% is transported along the Balkan highway.⁵ Albania, and the Balkans in general, are used as a source and transit for human trafficking victims. It focuses primarily upon sex trafficking, which is like a mature business in a number of ways.

The sex industry exhibits steady growth, with the largest growth coming from Eastern Europe, the same region as the Balkans and Albania.⁶ There are roughly 500,000-600,000 women and children globally trafficked into slavery every year with the Department of State assessing its total income to be around \$9.5 billion and the International Labor Organization estimating it to be around \$31.7 billion.⁷ The ILO says \$27.8 billion is generated yearly from sexual exploitation.⁸ Traffickers in East Europe move about 175,000 women and children on

²Michael D. Lyman, Garry W. Potter, *Organized Crime* (Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Pearson, Prentice Hall, 2004), 211

³Jana Arsovska (2006) “Understanding a ‘culture of crime and violence’: the Kanun of Lek Dukagjini and the Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets” *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law & Criminal Justice.*, Vol. 14 Issue 2, p161-184, 161

⁴Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 162

⁵Robert Hislope (2002). “Organized Crime in a Disorganized State.” *Problems Of Post-Communism*, 49(3), 34

⁶Siddharth Kara, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 17

⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 17

⁸Alexis A. Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking: Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009), 65

a yearly basis, with approximately 120,000 of them going to Western European countries like Germany, Italy, and the Netherlands.⁹ This again illustrates the difficulties in assessing exactly how extensive sex trafficking and the monetary value it brings in, but it is known that the Balkans is one of the largest contributors in the industry's growth and that Europe has the highest per capita consumption of the sex industry.¹⁰

Because women and children are a renewable commodity, their sale is quickly becoming a major source of income for organized crime in Albania and elsewhere.¹¹ The need for women and children will continue to grow and the traffickers will need to keep pace. To do this, the organized groups need to corrupt governments and law enforcement in order to transport victims across borders, create identification papers and alert the traffickers when police raids are imminent.¹² The Albanian mafia exists because of ineffective law enforcement, widespread poverty, and lack of legitimate jobs in Albania.¹³ The traffickers often operate through legitimate business fronts such as travel and employment agencies, entertainment competitions, and marriage agencies as a way to lure in recruits.¹⁴ However, human trafficking groups tend to be small and operate in loose networks as opposed to being highly centralized.¹⁵

By exploiting their largely informal international connections, Albanian groups move women along, usually into Europe where they are forced either to work as prostitutes or in

⁹Lyman, Potter, *Organized Crime*, 212

¹⁰Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 17

¹¹Lyman, Potter, *Organized Crime*, 212

¹²Lyman, Potter, *Organized Crime*, 212

¹³Hislope, "Organized Crime in a Disorganized State," 35

¹⁴Lyman, Potter, *Organized Crime*, 212

¹⁵Lyman, Potter, *Organized Crime*, 212

brothels.¹⁶ Italy is a prime market for exporting slaves because it is close to weak states (Albania, Moldova, Romania, etc.) and it has a long coastline that is very difficult to monitor.¹⁷ They have earned themselves a reputation as being one of the biggest threats to the European Union, according to a report by the European Union Organization Crime Report.¹⁸

The impact of the increasing Albanian influence has been felt in European cities like London, Rome, Milan, Frankfurt, Paris, Amsterdam, Athens, and Stockholm.¹⁹ Ethnic Albanians now control roughly 75% of prostitution operations in London.²⁰ Thanks to the contributions of the Albanians, the price of purchasing sex has decreased due to using slaves, though it would be very misleading to say they are solely responsible. For example, the price of sex in Italy has decreased 50% over the last decade due to the influx of sex slaves.²¹ This is but one example of the impact of Albanian organized crime. In order to really understand the depth of the scope of this issue, we must examine the nature of the Albanian group, their methods, and how it derives from their culture.

The presence of international personnel in peacekeeping operations and other missions in the Balkans cannot be ignored when discussing human trafficking in this region. The presence of the international force has increased human trafficking in the region. For example, over two hundred sex clubs opened when NATO and non-NATO member countries deployed over twenty thousand troops and over fourteen hundred police officers to rebuild

¹⁶Louise Shelley, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 121

¹⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 87

¹⁸Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 161

¹⁹Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 173

²⁰Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 172

²¹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 89

the law enforcement in Bosnia after the Dayton Peace Accords in 1995.²² According to the Special Trafficking Operations Program, upwards of 25% of the women in these clubs were trafficked.²³ The mix of having foreign personnel who are immune to prosecution and who have a great amount of disposable income has been a tragic combination. Victims have reported that military personnel, international workers, and Bosnian police as being their main clientele.²⁴

The UN and NATO both responded by creating new rules and procedures for disciplining its own personnel found to be involved in human trafficking. A zero-tolerance approach was announced by the UN in 2003, requiring the personnel to undergo training before deploying overseas, educating the local populations about the UN's zero-tolerance approach for human trafficking and establishing "off-limits" areas and curfews.²⁵ NATO, with six ongoing missions and over 70,000 troops abroad, has responded by increasing the amount of training its personnel undergoes before deployment and supporting local law enforcement in human trafficking cases.²⁶

The Process

To understand human trafficking, Aronowitz aptly notes that human trafficking is a process, not a single offense.²⁷ With that being the case, this research will reveal the process that Albanian groups use to enslave their victims. Albanian groups have a large pool of

²²Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 143

²³Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 143

²⁴Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 143

²⁵"Tourisme Sexuel", U.S. Department of State Publication 11407 Office of the Under Secretary for Democracy and Global Affairs and Bureau of Public Affairs, Revised June 2009, 316

²⁶"Tourisme Sexuel", 317

²⁷Alexis A. Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking: Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009), 29

vulnerable targets to choose from, especially from Romania. Romanian women and children are the most trafficked nationality in Europe and this largely is because of a fee to register Romanian children at birth, which some new parents cannot afford to pay.²⁸ As a result, these children are unprotected under law and turned out from orphanages at 14 years of age into the streets, where the human traffickers await them.²⁹ This demonstrates the conducive environment the Balkans give to human traffickers in which the Albanians operate.

In Albania, women and children are usually trafficked by relatives or friends who exploit the trust built up in the relationship to recruit them.³⁰ The high level of trust (*besa*) in the Albanian culture can make relatives and friends particularly vulnerable. *Besa* is supposed to be an inviolable trust, a sacred bond. Sometimes, the girls' own parents will convince them to go with boyfriends or acquaintance overseas, knowing full well what their intentions are.³¹

Another aspect of the Albanian crime model is the duration that the women are held in captivity. Like other organized crime groups, the Albanians prefer to target the poor in rural areas. Oftentimes, Albanians use false advertisements for work abroad because of the hard economic times in the Balkans after the Soviet Union, or friends or relatives will deceive them into slavery.³² Or, because Albanian women desire to marry as soon as possible, human traffickers will marry the women and sell them into slavery afterwards.³³ Indeed, as many as one third of Albanian victims rescued reported they had been enticed into slavery due to promises of marriage.³⁴

²⁸Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 149

²⁹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 149

³⁰Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 175

³¹Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 175

³²Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 176

³³Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 132

³⁴Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 55

Children from refugee camps are also targeted. According to one study in 2000, seven out of ten victims were children at the time they were trafficked.³⁵ Adults from refugee camps could also be targeted for labor exploitation in construction projects across Europe.³⁶ The extensiveness of this practice is not yet clear and will require more research. However, it can be seen that the Albanians prefer to target women and children, partly because they are easier to control and partly because they are easier to conceal.

Once ensnared, the traffickers break the spirit of the women and children. The traffickers accomplish this by beating and raping their victims. If the victims resist, then the traffickers break their arms or kill them.³⁷ If the traffickers kill a disobedient slave, then they make the other slaves clean up the mess as a way to further deter the slaves' willingness to defy their masters or attempt escape. Once their spirits are broken and they do as they are told, they are sold internationally to owners of brothels, strip clubs and massage parlors.³⁸

One of the reasons they are sold abroad is because the chances of them knowing the language decreases as they move about, decreasing the chances of escape.³⁹ In one International Organization for Migration shelter in Tirana, Albania, many of the survivors spoke Italian, German, Dutch and English because they had been moved so frequently.⁴⁰ This constant rotation is common practice for slaves in the sex industry in order to prevent men from developing relationships with the women and discovering their true story.⁴¹ Also, brothels prefer to move the women around constantly to keep new faces in rotation.

³⁵Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 145

³⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 145

³⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 12

³⁸Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 12

³⁹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 89

⁴⁰Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 61

⁴¹Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 61

According to the office of Ascoli Piceno, an Italian prosecutor, women are alternated every 6-7 months, making the job of tracing these women even more difficult.⁴²

Once the victims' spirits have thoroughly been broken, they can be trusted to work as prostitutes in apartments, hotels and streets.⁴³ Using these trafficked women as prostitutes complicates the legal proceedings. Law enforcement must determine if a prostitute is a trafficking victim, a difficult task when the women refuse to cooperate for fear of what the Albanian group will do to their families.

If Balkan victims do manage to escape, the communities they return to usually do not welcome them. Because many of the victims were recruited by relatives or acquaintances, they usually return to the same situation and they stand a good chance of being re-trafficked abroad.⁴⁴ This is because prostitution is not something condoned in Albania. It is not considered a proper job for a women and prostitutes are shunned. Also, Albania is poor and does not have the economic means to support a flourishing prostitution industry. The prostitution business is much more profitable in Europe than in Albania, thus the women and children are sent abroad.⁴⁵ However, some women are never sold. Whereas the usual term of bondage is 2-5 years, some Albanians hold their captives for life.⁴⁶

There is nothing particularly unique in the Albanian's system. Other organized crime groups also partake in the new slavery as a way to enrich themselves. What sets the Albanians apart, however, is the group member's willingness to use violence and cruelty to

⁴²Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 60

⁴³Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 12

⁴⁴Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 176

⁴⁵Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 180

⁴⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 12

achieve their objectives.⁴⁷ For example, the Italian Minister of the Interior reported that in 2000 there were 168 foreign prostitutes killed with most of their deaths attributed to the Albanians.⁴⁸ If human trafficking victims do not cooperate, they are inflicted with great bodily harm and their family members back home are threatened. Albanian groups will kill the relatives of a victim who escapes, is arrested, or attempts to contact the police.⁴⁹

Albanian groups have learned the importance of being invisible under the law by creating fake passports, visas and employment contracts. This, coupled with corrupting officials and law enforcement, has allowed the Albanian groups to easily move their victims to destinations with little trouble. Also aiding in the process were business fronts for travel, emigration, and study abroad programs to lure in victims.⁵⁰ A troubling trend starting after 2002 is that the traffickers procured legitimate legal documents for their victims from embassies. Once they obtain these documents, they can journey to any country in Europe, essentially making them invisible.⁵¹ This will make identifying trafficked women even more difficult in the future.

Creating the Culture for Slavery in the Balkans

Violent behavior must be viewed within the historical, social and cultural context because there is always logic behind actions. According to Marvin Wolfgang and Franco Ferracuti in their book *Subculture of Violence: Towards an Integrated Theory in Criminology*, there is always logic behind actions; they are not chaotic or spring from

⁴⁷Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 162

⁴⁸Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 172

⁴⁹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 94

⁵⁰Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 139

⁵¹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 116

nowhere.⁵² To understand the logic behind Albanian culture and its organized crime, we must examine the Kanun of Leke Dukagjini, a code of conduct written in the 15th century for all the affairs of the Albanian people. The Albanians created a culture conducive to modern slavery of women and children largely because of the Kanun. Albanian authorities and intelligence, however, deny this connection in an effort to improve the image of Albania on the world stage.⁵³

The Kanun is of paramount significant to Albanians, superseding the importance of the Ten Commandments and almost any other code of conduct or law. At its core is the desire to protect individual honor with the freedom of individuals to act within the limits of the law.⁵⁴ Though the Kanun discusses many issues related to daily life and has served as a kind of law, it also oppresses women and helped create a culture where women are easily victimized by human trafficking. Also, the Kanun undermines the rule of law. Though attributed to Leke Dukagjini (1410-1481), it has evolved over the centuries.

According to Valerie Hudson, Professor and Chair of the George H.W. Bush School of Government and Public Service at Texas A&M University, “cultures that value men over women oppress women the most because in those cultures women are either intrinsically despised, or viewed as only have instrumental value (that is, they are only valued insofar as they can offer something to men). Countries that legally encode patrilineality [sic] are some of the worst offenders, that is countries where women inherit less, have less right to divorce or child custody, less right to own land, etc.”⁵⁵

⁵²Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 165

⁵³Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 178

⁵⁴Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 165

⁵⁵Valerie Hudson, (2015, March 24). Email interview

In the Kanun, women are considered half the value of a man, or the same price of a dog.⁵⁶ A woman's husband is given dominion over her, even going so far as to give him the freedom to kill her if she dishonors him. What offenses are considered worthy of capital punishment? Infidelity and betrayal of hospitality.⁵⁷ The different values placed on men and women can also be observed by examining the duties of husbands and wives. A husband is responsible for providing clothing, shoes, and preserving his wife's honor. The wife, on the other hand, is obligated to preserve the honor of her husband, serve him in an unblemished manner, and to "submit to his domination."⁵⁸ A woman has the right to *ask* her husband for substance, one of the few rights given to women in the Kanun.⁵⁹

Blood feuds are condoned under the Kanun, so long as they started as a matter of preserving personal honor. If a woman kills her husband, she is not responsible for it. Rather, her parents are considered responsible.⁶⁰ This is not because of the desire to protect women, but rather because "the blood of a woman is not equal to the blood of a man; the parents of the wife therefore incur the blood of her husband."⁶¹

When parents give their daughters in marriage, they give their daughters' husbands a cartridge and a promise of good conduct. With the cartridge, the husband has the right to take her life if she commits adultery or betrays a hospitality.⁶² Hospitality is a matter of intense personal honor for Albanians as expressed in the Kanun. Once a guest comes under a person's roof, the host is obligated to protect that person and his honor. If someone insults

⁵⁶Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 170

⁵⁷Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 170

⁵⁸ Translated by Leonard Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini* (Bronx, New York: Gjonlekaj Publishing Company, 1989) Book Three, XIII, section 52

⁵⁹Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XIII, section 52

⁶⁰Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XIII, section 57

⁶¹Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XIII, section 57

⁶²Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XXXI

the guest, the host is obligated to defend the guest's honor, even at the risk of his own life.⁶³

If a man's hospitality is violated, he endures great social stigma until he avenges himself.

Within the Kanun can be seen justification for the conditions of slavery. For example, it says that a woman's labor and cohabitation is "purchased."⁶⁴ Also, if a husband beats his wife, no penalty is charged against him. If he beats her bloody, however, he must provide an explanation to the girl's parents and society requires no further retribution.⁶⁵ There is no reason given why a man would be justified to beat his wife but it appears assumed the occasion will arise. Summing up the role of wives in Albania is the statement that "A woman is known as a sack, made to endure as long as she lives in her husband's house."⁶⁶ If a man decides he wants to divorce his wife, he is instructed to shave her head, strip her nude, and drive her from his house with a whip in front of the community.⁶⁷

The Kanun was outlawed under communist rule, but the Soviets failed to introduce a different cultural development to create an alternative foundation of society. As a result, the ancient creeds remained the bedrock of Albanian culture.⁶⁸ However, Ismet Elezi, professor of law and a specialist in the Kanun, has pointed out that few Albanians under 35-years-old can recite the Kanun, and yet they use it to justify killing.⁶⁹ The Kanun taught people to solve disputes on their own without consulting the police. With that being the case, the concept of

⁶³Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Eight, XCVII, section 643

⁶⁴Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XIII, section 57

⁶⁵Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XIII, section 57

⁶⁶Translated by Fox, *The Code of Leke Dukagjini*, Book Three, XXVIII, article 57

⁶⁷Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 129

⁶⁸Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 168

⁶⁹Arsovska, "Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets", 169

the rule of law and order by a state is foreign in some parts of Albania.⁷⁰ The Kanun is followed not only in Albania, but among ethnic Albanians living abroad.

Women have technically held rights under the law for decades, but Albanian culture has not allowed it.⁷¹ Women report that they are still treated like slaves, according to a UNICEF report. The report also stated that women are treated like “chattel” in Albania.⁷² The Kanun has empowered this cultural bias against women in Albania for longer than other Balkan countries.⁷³ Its disregard for life has nurtured this culture and made women and children vulnerable. Unfortunately, it is still largely followed to this day, despite the fact that few Albanians can recite it.

Albania has strict laws concerning human trafficking with hefty penalties. For example, there is a 15 year sentence and a fine of up to \$80,000. The penalty is even greater for trafficking minors.⁷⁴ The reason these penalties have not been effective in halting organized crime from participating in human trafficking, however, is that the laws are not properly enforced due to corruption in the government.⁷⁵ This is partly due to the fact that Albania is not a wealthy country and does not pay its law enforcement enough to make bribes

⁷⁰Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 179

⁷¹Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 171

⁷²Adriana Baloan, *Domestic Violence Against Women in Albania*, United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund, n.d., URL:
<http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=4&ved=0CDcQFjAD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.unicef.org%2Falbania%2Fdomviol_eng.pdf&ei=UYsMVdGcO9i2yASG9YLwCA&usg=AFQjCNFe_Rrgu89ZQFeioJeJianP9UJ0Ug&bvm=bv.88528373,bs.1,d.eXY>, 13

⁷³Arsovska, “Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets”, 171

⁷⁴Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

⁷⁵Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

not enticing. The number of convictions have even been trumped up by government officials, according to U.S. personnel working within the U.S. embassy in Albania.⁷⁶

Impact of Modern Slavery in Albania

In a hearing of the Subcommittee on Europe and Eurasia of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, Mr. Kurt Volker, Senior Fellow and Managing Director at the Center for Transatlantic Relations, corrected Representative Tim Griffin (the Lieutenant Governor of Arkansas at the time of this writing) when he said intellectual crime was the biggest problem created by organized crime in the Balkans. Rather, Volker countered, extortion, money laundering, and trafficking in persons are the biggest problems that concern him.⁷⁷

Volker's comments demonstrate that organized crime groups do not usually restrict themselves to one source of income. Like businesses, they diversify their sources of income. In addition to human trafficking, Albanian groups also involve themselves in drug and arms trafficking.⁷⁸ They are also involved in organ trafficking, exploitation of prostitutes, facilitating illegal immigration, extortions, and various kinds of property crime.⁷⁹ The leaders of Albania, according to Volker, hold the country back from fully integrating with Europe because maintaining the status quo is in their best interests.⁸⁰

Organized crime, especially human trafficking, does not flourish in a strong, law-abiding state. Albania has a long history of foreign powers controlling it, from the time of the

⁷⁶Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

⁷⁷Kurt Volker in testimony before *The state of affairs in the Balkans [electronic resource]: hearing before the Subcommittee on Europe and Eurasia of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, first session, November 15, 2011*. (2011). Washington : U.S. G.P.O., 2011, 71

⁷⁸Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery*, 69

⁷⁹Jana Arsovska, "The 'G-Local' Dimension of Albanian Organized Crime: Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression" *European Journal of Criminal Policy Research* (2014) 20:205–223, 162

⁸⁰Volker, *The state of affairs in the Balkans*, 69

Romans to the Ottoman Empire to the Soviet Union. Its economy suffered over the centuries first because it did not undergo the same advancements its European counterparts made when it languished under Turkish rule, and then from isolationist policies at the turn of the 20th century after gaining its independence which continued largely under the communist leader Enver Hoxha.⁸¹ After the dissolution of the Soviet Union, however, the country plunged into an economic spiral, exacerbated by the collapse of several large pyramid schemes in 1997 that cost Albanian citizens over one billion dollars, totaling the savings of 70% of the country's citizens.⁸²

Human trafficking further weakens the Albanian state in a number of ways. First, it undermines the rule of law and increases the influence of criminal groups. As demonstrated earlier, substantial money can be earned by investing in human trafficking and the risk for doing so is low. Those that appear like they will be prosecuted usually escape to Russia. Second, there is a great deal of potential brain drain leaving the country by exporting so many women and children abroad. Third, human trafficking further weakens the state by putting additional strains on law enforcement.

Misconceptions about Organized Albanian Crime

There are some misconceptions about Albanian organized crime worth taking time to dispel. First, the impacts of globalization and the ways in which this aspect of modern life has impacted the Albanian “brand” of organized crime. Second, the hierarchal, tightly structured arrangement of the Albanian crime groups with a central organization at the top directing everything. Third, Albanian groups seize control of every criminal operation it can possibly involve itself in.

⁸¹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 141

⁸²Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 141

Globalization has impacted many, if not all, aspects of life around the world, but it has not impacted all organized crime the same way. Arsovska made excellent points in her paper about globalization and its impact on the Albanians. She points out that even though authors like Shelley, Castells, and Williams argue that international organizations are intentional about how they use globalization, she points out that there is another group of experts (Varese, Hobbs, and Gambetta) who disagree and believe that organized crime is very local and territorial, very unlike the corporation-like structure envisioned by the other authors.⁸³

Shelley argues that the Albanian groups move about to take advantage of opportunities elsewhere like businesses while Arsovska point out that Albanian groups operating abroad do so because something compelled them to leave.⁸⁴ In other words, they have no plan to take over the world and systematically spread their influence. This is partly because exporting a criminal operation is very difficult and largely depends upon the nature of the government in which the group operates.⁸⁵ Therefore, the Albanians only leave the Balkans when compelled due to by something like infighting, showing that these movements are not necessarily a business venture but a necessity.⁸⁶ Globalization has helped with the spread of people, Arsovska argues, some of whom happen to be criminals. The connection between Albanian groups and globalization is absent of a coherent plan of a centralized group to utilize it.⁸⁷

⁸³Jana Arsovska, "Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression", 206

⁸⁴Jana Arsovska, "Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression", 210

⁸⁵Jana Arsovska, "Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression", 219

⁸⁶Jana Arsovska, "Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression", 219

⁸⁷Jana Arsovska, "Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression", 220

Second, and closely related to the first topic, many observers assume the Albanians are held together by a tight, hierarchical structure similar to the Sicilian mafia. There is a myth that Albanians are held to secrecy by a “code of silence.” However, Arsovska argues that this is a myth. As for the myth that Albanians adhere to a code silence, it appears they talk more than other groups. According to Albanian Prosecutor Olsjan Cela, they are the most talkative criminals and they are usually arrested because they talked too much.⁸⁸ As for adhering to a tight structure, Arsovska states that Cela said, “People who do not understand our culture create images of hierarchies and strict division of labor. Albanian criminals do not work like that. The relationships in the groups are reciprocal, based on family and friendship ties, not on bureaucratic hierarchy”⁸⁹

There is no hierarchical structure, code of silence, nor are the groups working abroad controlled from a centralized group headquartering in the Balkans.⁹⁰ Instead, groups are usually arranged around family, clan and ethnic group.⁹¹ To prove this point, it was aptly pointed out that the groups abroad largely do not have the ability to recuperate after its leaders have been apprehended. This is because the group lacks an overarching group in the Balkans directing the group to rebuild and sending resources to aid in the effort. Instead, when the leaders of Albanian groups are arrested in Europe, other groups swoop in and takes advantage of the opportunity.⁹² Also, many of the Albanian individuals operating in criminal groups joined the group after arriving to their new destinations, not before.⁹³

Conclusion

⁸⁸Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 218

⁸⁹Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 218

⁹⁰Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 218

⁹¹Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 217

⁹²Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 218

⁹³Jana Arsovska, “Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression”, 221

The end of the Soviet Union marked a time for the Balkans when the government no longer guaranteed jobs, as the Soviet Union had done for over 50 years.⁹⁴ The ensuing economic downturn turned many Albanians to crime and made others more vulnerable to human trafficking. Also, Europe impacts the financial stability of the Balkans. For example, the European Union constructed agricultural trade barriers, which helps to create poverty in Balkan nations and an opportunity for human trafficking to take root.⁹⁵ The movement of people is so rapid that it is almost impossible for a country to monitor all borders.⁹⁶ All too often, the response of European countries has been motivated by a desire to remove the victims and not assist them.⁹⁷ Attempting to fix the problem has largely resulted in more legislation against illegal immigrants, which creates future customers for the organized crime groups as more individuals turn to criminal networks to smuggle them over borders.⁹⁸

Creating legislation that does not give any safe haven to traffickers will be essential when moving forward. “While ad hoc arrangements, bilateral mutual legal assistance and extradition treaties may bear positive results in some instances, the complexities of the legislative and procedural framework within and across jurisdictions sometimes prevent them from achieving their purpose.”⁹⁹

Mr. Ivan Vejvoda, Vice President of the German Marshall Fund of the United States, says that reform is key in improving the security of the Balkans. This includes cleaning up the judicial system and fighting corruption and organized crime from crossing borders. This,

⁹⁴Stoecker, “Role of Organized Crime”, 129

⁹⁵Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 221

⁹⁶Stoecker, “Role of Organized Crime”, 136

⁹⁷Shelley, *A Global Perspective*, 202

⁹⁸Stoecker, “Role of Organized Crime”, 130

⁹⁹United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons*, (New York, NY: United Nations Publication, 2006), 1

he admits, will be challenging because of the difficulty of working with other nations. Indeed, the best regional cooperation is between criminals because when it is in their best interests Serbians, Albanians and other groups from the Balkans work together remarkably well.¹⁰⁰

The Albanians, and organized crime for that matter, differ from how ISIS and terrorist groups utilize slavery. Instead of being motivated by quasi-religious and military reasons, the organized crime groups are interested only in maximizing their income. The Albanians are a transnational threat, but not by design. They operate more like a business as they traffic women and children and have many similarities to drug trafficking. With that being the case, strategies learned from the drug trade can be brought to bear, such as attacking the money of these groups.

Improving the economic situation within source countries, such as Albania and other Balkan states, will also aid in diminishing the desperation needed to create victims. A stronger economy would also help procure more funding for the state and diminish opportunities for bribes and creating witness protection programs. Until then, Albanian groups will likely continue using human trafficking to enrich themselves and expand their influence in a loosely-arranged network that gives them flexibility in adapting to new legislation. Conflict zones also present an excellent opportunity for traffickers, giving them an incentive to keep regions in flux.

Instead of parading in the open and celebrating slavery as a part of its identity like ISIS, organized crime stealthily infiltrates itself into the community where it operates and puts up business fronts. With that being the base, organized crime groups like the Albanians

¹⁰⁰Ivan Vejvoda, *The state of affairs in the Balkans*, 71

gain more and more influence in urban centers around the world, operating largely in secrecy as they amass more resources and improving their operational efficiency by corrupting law enforcement and political officials. Human trafficking is already the second largest source of income from organized crime, and it is possible that it will surpass even the drug trade in revenue because people can be used over and over again whereas drugs can only be sold once.¹⁰¹

¹⁰¹“Study Shows Sex Trafficking Has Become More Profitable Than Selling Drugs” *Local Memphis* (online), September 4, 2013, URL: <<http://www.localmemphis.com/news/local/story/Study-Shows-Sex-Trafficking-Has-Become-More/d/story/t2khCwnCd0S35XFCMoxAHw>>, accessed February 21, 2015

Chapter Five: North Korea

Human Trafficking Used by a State

North Korea represents everything contradictory to the American vision for the world, whether that be free global markets and prosperity in the private economy, non-proliferation of nuclear weapons, or humanitarian issues. It epitomizes a rogue state as it sows instability in every matter it touches. North Korea uses forced labor as a tool to silence its opponents in labor camps and as a way to generate profits by sending North Koreans abroad to earn money for the regime. This case study will strive to show how a rogue nation can use slavery to further its aims and how North Korea utilizes slavery. Following will be a discussion about its application and how its impact differs from the previous examples.

The State

The official commencement of conflict for the U.S. on the Korean peninsula began with the Korean War in 1950. After the war, both North and South Korea desired to reunite the peninsula under its own style of government. Kim Jong-Sung of North Korea formed a regime that not only challenged, and continues to challenge the U.S. and the very existence of South Korea, but also became a global leader of rogue nations that picks at the fabric of the international community. Both Koreas live in fear of invasion from their neighbor to this day. North Korea is not necessarily a weak state; Kim Jung-un holds tight control of the country and as far as can be seen from the outside, is advancing with the perceived interests of North Korea. However, it is a failed society. The government is oppressive, rarely allowing any outsiders into the country for fear of what they may say. Its leaders live in constant fear of uprisings. According to Amnesty International, North Korea has political

prisons with hundreds of thousands serving long sentences,¹ and the country struggles to provide food for its citizens. In 2014, a drought brought the daily consumption in North Korea from 410 grams to 250 grams.²

The Threat

North Korea, despite its relatively small size on the international stage, presents a surprisingly large threat thanks to the ruthless and efficient manner in which it pursues its goals in the arena of statecraft through negotiations and through more “thuggish” methods in illegal markets and organized crime. This combination makes it a dangerous hybrid of state and organized crime. It is neither a nation that fears corruption nor an organized crime ring that fears the existence of law and order. Perhaps it is this volatile combination that makes it so difficult for the U.S. to counter North Korea.

The most highlighted method by which North Korea threatens the U.S. and the surrounding region is its pursuit of nuclear weapons. The horrors that could be unleashed in a nuclear attack by North Korea are very real and something that analysts must take into consideration. Not only would North Korea possess the physical ability to unleash hell on whatever chosen target, it would also gain an obvious advantage in bargaining with the U.S. or whatever country they desire should they obtain a fully operational WMD. To this end, the regime has been working since the 1960s. This program has proven an invaluable bargaining chip against the U.S. and the world in general. Acquiring funding for building up this arsenal, then, is important.

¹Amnesty International, *The State of the World's Human Rights*, February 25, 2015, URL: <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/pol10/0001/2015/en/>>, accessed March 3, 2015, 216

²Amnesty International, *Human Rights*, 217

Brinkmanship in the past has proven to be an essential skill in making nuclear weapons truly effective in pursuing a nation's goals. Nations the world over fear what a nuclear attack would bring for good reason. There has never been a nuclear attack on another nation since the end of World War Two, largely because of the fear of repercussions. If North Korea can pretend it does not fear the repercussions, they will have the power to manipulate other nations, as they have proven they are perfectly capable of doing.

North Korean diplomacy comes in cycles. First, they engage in some form of brinkmanship. This usually involves proliferating nuclear weapons, such as in in 2006 when they launched first a long range missile and then an underground nuclear test. It can also commit such acts as bombarding the Yeonpyeong Island in November of 2010 with artillery. In the latter example, North Korea blamed South Korea for the provocation, saying it would not have happened had there been a peace treaty between the countries.³

After the provocative action, they engage in temporary talks, only to leave the table and come back later to demand concessions. The North Koreans hail any concession from the U.S. as a sign of weakness and capitulation. Any talks from the U.S. concerning a desire for peace are also hailed as a sign of weakness.⁴ President Barrack Obama is attempting to discontinue this cycle, saying in a World Post article, "I don't think that there should be an assumption that we will simply continue down a path in which North Korea is constantly

³Bruce E. Bechtol, Jr., *The Last Days of Kim Jong-Il: The North Korean Threat in a Changing Era*, (Washington, DC: Potomac Books, 2013): 80-81

⁴H. Thomas Henriksen, *America and the Rogue States* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012): 142

destabilizing the region and we just react in the same ways by, after they've done these things for a while, then we reward them.”⁵

Instead of complying with the agreements it has made in the past, such as the Agreed Framework in 1994 and the promises (though only verbally) that came out of the Six-Party Talks, North Korea has gone out of its way to prove to the world that it has nuclear capabilities and it is unafraid to use them. How effective these are, however, still has yet to be seen. Its second nuclear test in 2009 showed improvement from the first test but the device proves rudimentary.⁶ The ability to deliver a weapon to the desired target will doubtlessly be the regime's next big challenge. The easiest target of such an attack would be South Korea but there are good reasons to believe this may not be the largest threat facing Seoul.

Raising Money

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, North Korea sought ways to replace the funds the USSR had provided in subsidizing their activities. North Korea sold technology and weapons to any buyers. Unfortunately, these buyers included nations like Iran, Burma and Syria. This has proven a successful program for the rogue nation. Transferring chemical weapons programs to the Middle East has proven to be a very lucrative business. Iran invested anywhere from \$1-2 billion for North Korean assistance in creating a nuclear project.⁷

⁵Jennifer Loven, “Obama Calls North Korea ‘Extraordinarily Provocative’” *Huffington Post*, June 6, 2009, URL: <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2009/06/06/obama-calls-north-korea-e_n_212149.html>, accessed May 7, 2014

⁶Henriksen, *America and the Rogue States*, 139

⁷Bruce E., Bechtol, Jr., *Defiant Failed State*, (Washington, DC: Potomac Books, 2010), 52

Selling weapons is not the only method North Korea uses to strengthen itself. North Korea's black market poses a very real threat to the region because of its destabilizing effect on the local economies. The production and delivery of methamphetamines has helped fund the regime's elite in both their lavish lifestyle and their pursuit of nuclear weapons. As a matter of fact, methamphetamines account for 43% of North Korea's sizeable illegal market.⁸ Because the drug market is so closely connected with organized crime, it obviously has a destabilizing impact on the economies in the region and it is difficult to act against them because these crime rings have a place they can safely operate.

The North Korean government has failed to create economic relationships with other countries and its citizens have turned more and more to the black market as a way to procure food. This has adversely impacted the regime's ability in labor planning, something which drastically undermines the regime's ability to build its economy.⁹

Obtaining information on North Korea's internal dealings poses a challenge because of the reclusive nature of the regime, but there are still witness accounts from North Koreans who escape the country. From these witnesses we catch a glimpse into the strategy of North Korea's new leader. Reports from refugees and researchers indicate that Kim Jong-un is ensnaring his people with job offers abroad and then sending them to tightly guarded places like logging camps in Russia, factories in China, construction sites in the Middle East and Africa, digging military tunnels in Myanmar, and on fishing boats in Fiji.¹⁰

⁸Bechtol, Jr., *Defiant Failed State*, 84

⁹North Korea Strategy Center, *The Conditions of the North Korean Overseas Laborers*, May 2013, URL: <<http://en.nksc.co.kr/our-work/research/reports/nksc-report-on-the-human-rights-conditions-of-overseas-north-korean-laborers/>>, accessed March 2, 2015, 13

¹⁰Choe Sang-Hun "North Korea Exports Labor for Profit, Rights Groups Say," *New York Times*, February 19, 2015, URL:

The wages that the workers earn are sent back to North Korea, where they enrich Kim Jung-un and his government. This policy is not new. In 2012, the North Korea Policy Research Center estimated that anywhere 60,000 to 65,000 North Koreans were working in 40 countries under the watchful eye of their government, bringing in \$150 million to \$320 million a year for the Korean regime.¹¹ Subcontracting makes it possible for slaves to be exploited in the legitimate economy,¹² something it appears very likely that the North Korean government has seized upon. According to the North Korea Strategy Center, the regime could bring in as much as \$1.5-2.3 billion.¹³ Since then, the number of North Koreans sent abroad has swollen to 100,000 as Kim Jung-un seeks to find a way to fill his coffers despite international trade sanctions placed on the country.¹⁴ This is North Korea's response to sanctions and an effort to bring foreign currency back into the economy.¹⁵ Money sent back is not in the form of remittances, but instead go directly to the regime's accounts through the Labor Party's Office 39 and is used to reward the regime's elite followers and finance construction projects in North Korea to bolster the reputation of the Leader.¹⁶

The workers are told they will receive payment when they return to North Korea, and in the meantime they borrow money from the North Korean recruitment company for living

<<http://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/20/world/asia/north-koreans-toil-in-slavelike-conditions-abroad-rights-groups-say.html>>, accessed February 22, 2015

¹¹North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*

¹²Beate Andrees, "Trafficking for Forced Labor in Europe" in *Forced Labor: Coercion and Exploitation in the Private Economy*, (eds) Beate Andrees, Patrick Belser, (Boulder, CO: Lynn Reinner Publishers, Inc., 2009), 89

¹³North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*, 12

¹⁴Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

¹⁵Pete Pattison, "North Koreans working as 'state-sponsored slaves' in Qatar" *The Guardian*, November 7, 2014, URL: <<http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2014/nov/07/north-koreans-working-state-sponsored-slaves-qatar>>, accessed March 15, 2015

¹⁶Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

expenses abroad.¹⁷ This arrangement perhaps creates a situation of indebtedness similar to other situations of slavery. As mentioned earlier, these workers are involved in almost every kind of work, including a reported 3000 workers in Qatar helping with construction projects related to the World Cup matches in 2022.¹⁸

This arrangement benefits the countries in which these workers labor. For example, China finds itself in a labor shortage in the northeast part of the country (along the North Korean border) partly due to North Korea cracking down on its citizens escaping into China.¹⁹ However, North Korea is wary of sending too many workers abroad for fear of them becoming indoctrinated and exposed to outside influences.²⁰ To minimize this chance, the regime seeks to place workers in areas with fewer people, like deep in the forests of Russia while logging.²¹

North Koreans can work up to 20 hours a day in grueling conditions, making as little as \$5.30 an hour that is then sent back to the homeland. In one account, a man working in a Siberian logging camp reported that he made \$5.30 an hour and discovered later that Russian workers were making \$30 an hour.²² The Worker's Party, the political party in North Korea, sought to increase their earnings from this modern slavery by demanding that a group of North Korean workers in Kuwait earn \$500,000 a month for the state. The North Koreans worked longer hours and then found odd jobs in the community to meet their quota.²³

¹⁷Pattison, "North Koreans working as 'state-sponsored slaves' in Qatar"

¹⁸Pattison, "North Koreans working as 'state-sponsored slaves' in Qatar"

¹⁹North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*

²⁰North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*

²¹North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*

²²Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

²³Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

Despite the conditions, however, many North Koreans consider these arrangements better than starving back home. Workers perceive obtaining these jobs as an honor, something which citizens will actually bribe officials to receive.²⁴ Money earned is supposedly sent home to their family members, but witness accounts say that the families are given coupons to state-owned stores that do not carry anything.²⁵ According to a report by the U.S. Department of State (DoS), the earnings they receive are put into a state controlled account which takes liberties in deciding how much the workers want to “voluntarily” donate to the state.²⁶ According to the DoS, China allowed tens of thousands of North Korean workers to labor in their industrial sector, where they made \$200-\$300 a month. Of that money, however, the workers actually received less than \$50.²⁷ Workers’ passports are confiscated and their families are threatened with reprisals if they complain to outsiders about their plight.²⁸

Even while abroad, the regime continues indoctrinating its citizens. The laborers are given few afternoons off but those they receive are spent listening to speeches about the greatness of North Korea. Workers are not allowed to mingle with those of other nationalities. For example, when possible, their overseers send them to a different floor when working in factories and lock the doors.²⁹ Also, guards constantly monitor communication

²⁴Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

²⁵Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

²⁶Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

²⁷U.S. Department of State, *2013 Human Rights Reports: Democratic People's Republic of Korea*, February 27, 2014, URL: <<http://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/2013/eap/220202.htm>>, accessed March 10, 2015, Section 7, D

²⁸Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

²⁹North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*, 50

with the outside world. Communication with family back in North Korea is rare and when it is granted, it is strictly censored.³⁰

In Kuwait, with 3,500 exported North Korean workers, an individual worker usually earns “\$5,000 per year. The North Korean government takes 48% of the amount, \$2,400. Out of the rest, \$2,600, Bangladesh Transport Company takes 10%, North Korean embassy of the Labor Bureau takes 25%, and Kuwait presiding North Korean company and regional workshops take 40% for operating expenses. Eventually, an individual North Korean worker receives approximately \$1,000 per year, meaning the workers’ monthly salaries are \$70-80.”³¹

Labor Camps

North Korea’s labor camps provide another example of how the state uses forced labor as a way to further its aims, in this case creating a more submissive population. *Sungboon* is a social caste system in North Korea where the people are divided according to their loyalty to the party. Those deemed loyal to the party receive the best education, jobs, and food rationing. Those at the bottom of the system are those whose ancestors cooperated with the Japanese during World War Two or who defected to South Korea during the Korean War. They make do with the worst jobs, education and constant fear of being sent to labor camps.³²

Those who are sent to the labor camps may or may not know why they were sent in the first place. Kim Young Soon, in giving testify before the subcommittee of Africa, Global

³⁰North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*, 50

³¹North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*, 43

³²Lee Hae Young, *Lives for Sale: Personal Accounts of Women Fleeing North Korea to China*, Report by Committee for Human Rights in North Korea, (Washington, DC: 2009), 12

Health and Human Rights said that she was incarcerated in Camp 15 in Yoduk and was not told why she had been arrested until after her release. Talking about the cyst or lump on Kim Jung Ill's neck, knowing about the Leader's personal life, accidentally damaging a portrait or statue of Kim Jung Ill, listening to foreign media, or questioning the regime were all reasons to be incarcerated.³³

According to Kim Hye Sook, also a witness before the subcommittee of Africa, Global Health and Human Rights and survivor of Camp 18, Bukchang camp, prisoners are required to work 16-18 hour days in the coal mines with very little food. A family of seven, for example, were given only ten pounds of corn every month.³⁴ The inmates ate grass, bark, leaves, anything green or semi edible in order to survive. One of the rules that was given to the prisoners from the start of their imprisonment was that the inmates were not allowed to know why that had been detained but those not showing enough repentance were shot by firing squads.³⁵

Greg Scarlatoiu, Executive Director for the Committee for Human Rights in North Korea, in testimony before the subcommittee of Africa, Global Health and Human Rights, pointed out that the prison camps have actually increased in recent years. According to satellite images and reports from Amnesty International, the camps now hold as many as 200,000 prisoners.³⁶

³³Kim Young Soon, *Human rights in North Korea [electronic resource] : challenges and opportunities : hearing before the Subcommittee on Africa, Global Health, and Human Rights of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, first session, September 20, 2011*. n.p.: Washington : U.S. G.P.O., 2011., 2011. *Government Printing Office Catalog*, EBSCOhost (accessed March 16, 2015), 14

³⁴Kim Hye Sook, *Human rights in North Korea*, 20

³⁵Kim Hye Sook, *Human rights in North Korea*, 15

³⁶Greg Scarlatoiu, *Human rights in North Korea*, 27

An important question that needs answered in relation to the labor camps in North Korea is what is the connection between the labor camps and North Korea's economy? Unfortunately, North Korea's secretive nature has made such research difficult to perform. Mr. Scarlatoiu told me in an interview that he is currently ascertaining the connection between the two. With that being said, however, Scarlatoiu revealed that "We know that prisoners have been involved in coal mining production for uniforms for the military, agricultural production as well. The prisoners have been put in charge of pig farms without being allowed to eat the pork. So there is economic activity and at the very least the guards and officials running the prison camps draw significant economic benefits from their presence from being there."³⁷

Scarlatoiu went on to say that, "This is the worst way of employing the work force. Slave labor is not an efficient way of using the work force. There is a very strong punitive element embedded in how the prisoners are treated. They work in coal mines with very rudimentary means. Basically they are using picks and axes. So that's what makes this determination so difficult."³⁸

Human Trafficking Along the China-North Korea Border

Regardless the harsh penalties from North Korea for those attempting to escape, and from China for illegally migrating, many North Korean refugees attempt to escape to China in a bid for freedom. Mr. Scarlatoiu said women are especially vulnerable to human trafficking because about 70% of those who decide to leave North Korea are women.³⁹ Many of these refugees are women and they are vulnerable once they cross the North Korean-

³⁷Greg Scarlatoiu, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

³⁸Greg Scarlatoiu, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

³⁹Greg Scarlatoiu, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

Chinese border. Traffickers often smuggle the women over the border into China to Chinese men who have purchased them as “wives.”⁴⁰

From the start, however, these women do not enjoy any measure of security. The Chinese government offers them no protection or rights and they can be returned to North Korea if their “husbands” report them.⁴¹ If returned to North Korea, they suffer great penalties perhaps as severe as torture and death because escaping from the country is seen as an act of treason. Even if their husbands do not abuse the relationship, their children are not recognized as legal in China and do not enjoy the same protections of others.⁴² Kim Hye Sook also lent firsthand perspective about this issue in her testimony.

“After narrowly escaping death and coming out of North Korea and into China and then becoming victims of human and sexual trafficking, I can say with authority that the tragic situation of the North Korean refugee women must be told again and again in the international community. *I myself was sold four different times in four different cities in China.* And the inhumane and the indescribable suffering that these women go through in China, being sold like commodity, still keeps me awake at night. [emphasis added]”⁴³

Those returned to North Korea can be assured that the penalty from their government will not be lenient. According to article 47 of the 1987 North Korean Criminal Code, those who defect and leave the country without permission are traitors. For crossing a border of North Korea without permission, the lawbreakers are sentenced to up to three years at least in

⁴⁰Committee for Human Rights in North Korea, *Lives for Sale*, 7

⁴¹David Hawk, *The Hidden Gulag*, Report by Committee for Human Rights in North Korea (Washington, DC: 2012), 114

⁴²Young, *Lives for Sale*, 7

⁴³Sook, *Human rights in North Korea*, 22

a political prison.⁴⁴ Depending upon who the refugees contacted outside of the country, they might be sentenced to death.

Under international law and the treaties that China has signed, the Chinese government should be prohibited from returning the North Korean refugees who seek asylum in their country. This point is made very clear under article 33(1) of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, where it explicitly says that no refugee seeking asylum within a country can be returned to the country in which they will be persecuted.⁴⁵ There is an office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) in Beijing that would be in an excellent position to help the refugees, but the Chinese government return them too quickly for this organization to take action.⁴⁶

This can largely be explained by China's bilateral agreement with North Korea called the "Bilateral Agreement on Mutual Cooperation for Maintenance of the State Safety and Social Order" signed in July 1998. This agreement essentially says that China will return North Korean refugees to North Korea.⁴⁷ However, sometimes North Korean authorities do not wait for its citizens to be deported. There are reports of North Korean officials crossing the Chinese border and searching for North Korean refugees.⁴⁸

By law, the Chinese should settle the refugees in South Korea because South Korea says it considers North Korean refugees as its citizens. Either that, or the refugees should be settled in the U.S. according to U.S. agreements with the UNHCR. However, China enables

⁴⁴ T. Kumar, *China's Repatriation of North Korean Refugees*, Testimony before the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, March 5, 2012, retrieved from Amnesty International's website, URL: <<http://www.amnestyusa.org/news/news-item/china-s-repatriation-of-north-korean-refugees>>, accessed February 23, 2015

⁴⁵ Kumar, *China's Repatriation*

⁴⁶ Kumar, *China's Repatriation*

⁴⁷ Kumar, *China's Repatriation*

⁴⁸ Kumar, *China's Repatriation*

human trafficking by not following the treaties it signed, according to Suzanne Scholte, president of the Defense Forum Foundation in testimony before the subcommittee of Africa, Global Health and Human Rights ⁴⁹

Scarlatoiu pointed out that there are three main reasons North Koreans cross the border with China instead of the border with South Korea through the DMZ. First, the longest border that North Korea has is with China and thus the easiest to cross. Second, North Koreans see the economic contrast between China and North Korea. Third, many of the people living in the provinces along the border may have contacts over the border.⁵⁰

Conclusion

North Korea seeks to maintain its defiant stance against the U.S. and international sanctions while also maintaining foreign currency. The country cannot withstand much more economic depression at this point. To answer this problem, the Kim Jung-un regime has resorted to selling its citizen's labor abroad, essentially making them work as slaves with the threat of their family's lives back home in jeopardy should they try to escape. North Koreans work in almost every kind of construction work around the globe in state-sponsored slavery.

Also, the regime has created a situation in which many refugees attempting to flee the country are trapped in legal limbo between China and North Korea, making them extremely vulnerable to human trafficking and slavery within China. Though not the direct actions of North Korea, it nevertheless is a situation the regime is largely responsible for creating. Its existence helps the government deter those who wish to defect to China.

⁴⁹Suzanne Scholte, *Human rights in North Korea*, 15

⁴⁹Scarlatoiu, *Human rights in North Korea*, 44

⁵⁰Greg Scarlatoiu, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

The political prison camps are also used as a tool to punish those who resist the regime or do not show it enough honor. Those unfortunate enough to fall within the camps are worked like slaves and what little freedom they had is removed completely. Again, we see North Korea using slavery as a means (extreme punishment) to an end (complete submission to the state). The camps also play a role in North Korea's economy, though the exact extent is not known. Knowing the relationship between North Korea's economy and the labor camps will further clarify the possible substantial link between slave labor and supporting the North Korean economy and regime.

North Korea offers an excellent example of how modern slavery can be used by a rogue state to further its goals. The hermit kingdom differs from the previous examples in some fundamental ways. It differs from ISIS in that it does not have a religious motivation for enslaving its enemies. Albeit, the veneration for Kim Jung-un borders on religious, but slavery is used as a means to the ends of the state, not as the end in and of itself or as enforcement of an identity.

North Korea differs from the Albanian crime group because of its structure of organization. Whereas the Albanians are largely unconnected and are spread around the world, the North Korean government maintains tight control of its workers and exercises centralized control. Not only that, but it is far easier for the North Korean government to exploit its workers in broad daylight and integrate slavery into the legal economy. After all, North Korean citizens working abroad is not illegal. What makes it slavery, however, is how the North Korean government enriches themselves with the worker's wages and removes their freedom. There are many questions about North Korea's use of human trafficking that will not be answered until the country becomes more transparent, a thing that is not likely to

happen in the near future. Mr. Scarlatoiu says he will also reveal a report in the spring of 2015 discussing North Korea exporting labor abroad.

In dealing with North Korea, some experts believe we should focus solely on the human rights issues confronting North Korea and no longer on the nuclear issue. This is because North Korea has proven itself masterful at manipulating talks to achieve their objectives while not delivering on their promises. By focusing on human rights issues and reaching out to the people of North Korea, it would be possible to strike at the legitimacy of the regime. That is the opinion of Ms. Scholte, president of the Defense Forum Foundation. “I think that we should make human rights the number one policy of our Government.”⁵¹

Reigning in North Korea’s use of slavery will require the international community to pay close attention to the labor practices of industries. Perhaps, it will be necessary to make employing North Koreans illegal to combat the regime’s use of slavery to enrich itself in defiance of the sanctions placed upon it. This may succeed only in hurting the citizens of North Korea and harming the population will not impact the stance of a country with 200,000 political prisoners⁵² and will only make the indoctrinated population hate outsiders even more. This much is clear from studying our previous engagements with North Korea; negotiating with North Korea is not likely to work. Ending slavery in North Korea will weaken the regime, a sworn enemy of the U.S. Doing so, then, should be a priority to U.S. strategists and policymakers if the humanitarian issues are not reason enough.

⁵¹Scholte, *Human rights in North Korea*, 33

⁵²Greg Scarlatoiu, *Human rights in North Korea*, 27

Conclusion

In closing, modern slavery has many forms and has proven to be highly adaptable to whatever the person or group has required of it. Slavery is used by religious terrorist groups, organized crime, and governments. However, there are a vast number of possibilities in other ways that slavery can be used, restricted only by the malefactor's imagination and means. Because it thrives outside the rule of law, its perseverance comes at the cost of law and order and will continue to be both a creation and a creator of corruption and instability.

The U.S. has taken the lead to stop this practice. In 2003, after long negotiations among states concerning repatriations and the matter of whether or not prostitution would be legal on the international stage, the required number of nations signed the Trafficking Protocol and in 2004 signed the Smuggling Protocol. These actions gave the world a uniform standard to approach human trafficking.¹ However, the U.S. had already set up laws in compliance with the protocols before they had been ratified.

In October of 2000, President Clinton signed the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act and President George Bush issued Executive Directive 22 that forbade U.S. government employees and contractors from engaging in human trafficking. If a company was found to be involved with human trafficking, the U.S. government would end its business with that company.² In 2005, the U.S. passed the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (TVPRA) and established the Department of State's yearly Trafficking in Person's (TIP) report.³

¹Anthony M. Destafano, *The War on Human Trafficking: U.S. Policy Assessed* (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 2008), 28

²Destafano, *U.S. Policy Assessed*, 104

³Destafano, *U.S. Policy Assessed*, 117

As Destafano points out in his book, however, the provisions of the TVPRA, though sweeping and aimed at prosecution, protection and prevention, was weakened by prosecution being the only aspect that could be measured, making it difficult to determine TVPRA's effectiveness.⁴ Even with that being the case, it can also be seen that before 2003, only 5% of the signing countries to the protocols had laws specifically aimed at trafficking. By 2008, however, that number grew to 53%, a noticeable improvement.⁵ Notwithstanding, the U.S. took the lead on the issue of slavery by creating laws before the protocols were passed and putting the issue on the international agenda.⁶

Despite international laws, however, slavery has managed to flourish. As long as the conditions for human trafficking continue to exist (weak states, cultures that facilitate violence against women, religions that condone slavery), human trafficking will likely continue to exist as well. This is because the chances of being caught are low, and the chances in many parts of the world of being prosecuted are even lower. In many countries, globalization has so empowered the human traffickers that they can operate with great impunity.

In order to remove slavery, which is being used as a weapon against the U.S. and its allies, from our enemies, it will be necessary to make the penalties high for human trafficking and also make prosecution something that can be done with more ease. This will require a great deal of international cooperation between different law enforcements because of the global nature of modern slavery. More countries need to practice extradition with each other, to avoid situations like in the Balkans where suspected traffickers can escape to Russia and

⁴Destafano, *U.S. Policy Assessed*, 117

⁵United Nation Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), Global Report on the Trafficking in Persons, *Human Trafficking: A Crime that Shames Us All*, February 2009, 25

⁶Destafano, *U.S. Policy Assessed*, 117

be free from pursuit of the authorities.⁷ Until then, the sufferings of hundreds of thousands of men, women and children will continue to fuel the ambitions of our enemies and those who profit from the demise of the rule of law.

We, the U.S. and the western world, stand to gain a great deal by focusing more upon human trafficking now. As pointed out earlier, it is the second largest source of criminal income and it is quite possibly the largest. Identifying the most threatening incarnations of slavery, however, will be most useful in deciding how to address it. As judge Falcone pointed out, we need to examine the different models and find weaknesses to the individual systems instead of simply developing a global, uniform approach.⁸ Examining these threats and understanding what makes them unique, then, is an important first step in finding solutions.

ISIS and other terrorist organizations have proven quite capable of combining old traditions and practices of slavery to create a justification for it. Not only that, but they parade their use of slavery out into the open, making it something that is central to their identity. In *Dabiq*, the language conveys the vision of a world where Muslims, specifically those aligned with the jihad, rule over the world like masters.⁹ When spoken in the context of a radical part of a religion that accepts no compromise, it should be cause for concern. Not only, then, is slavery an outlawed practice and institution but it is also a method to establish a caliphate and exert their control.

The weakness of ISIS in regards to its human trafficking is that this strategy alienates those under its temporary control. While its propagandists work to win the hearts and minds

⁷Siddharth Kara, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 127

⁸Louise Shelley, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 132

⁹“A New Era Has Arrived of Might and Dignity for the Muslims” *Dabiq*, July 2014, Issue 1 (The Return of Khilafah), 8

of Muslims by offering incentives such as slavery for those who participate, it increases the number of enemies that ISIS has. Bringing back slavery has been a large part of this terrorist group's strategy and it has done much to bring in recruits, but it is doubtful if it can be a useful strategy in a long struggle. The practice of slavery within ISIS controlled territory has not been divulged just yet, but it can be speculated that holding such a high number of slaves in this caliphate poses some security challenges for ISIS, like how to prevent the slaves from escaping while also fighting other groups and the Assad regime.

Albanian organized crime groups served as an example, but there are many other groups using human trafficking in a very similar. The level of violence justified by Albanian organized crime, and their ability to partner with other groups in the Balkans, sets the Albanians apart. These characteristics originate with the Balkan culture that is highly influenced by the Kanun. Though the Kanun does not institutionalize slavery in so many words, it does create the situation needed for modern slavery. Women are treated like chattel in many instances and violence is largely condoned as a culture, though the Albanian government has made strides to improve the rule of law and decrease violence, these efforts have also been bedeviled by corruption within its law enforcement due to low budgeting.

Albania has strict laws concerning human trafficking with hefty penalties. For example, there is a 15 year sentence and a fine of up to \$80,000. The penalty is even greater for trafficking minors.¹⁰ The reason these penalties have not been effective in halting organized crime from participating in human trafficking, however, is that the laws are not properly enforced due to corruption in the government.¹¹ This is partly due to the fact that Albania is not a wealthy country and does not pay its law enforcement enough to make bribes

¹⁰Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

¹¹Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

not enticing. The number of convictions have even been trumped up by government officials, according to U.S. personnel working within the U.S. embassy in Albania.¹²

Though the Albanians and ISIS are similar in their willingness to use violence, they differ in a few fundamental ways. First, factors such as globalization and transnational crime are perhaps more relevant to this form of human trafficking than it is in the small, localized area of Syria and Iraq. Though victims move about in the Middle East, they are not transported around the world to meet the demands of clients. Second, Albanian crime groups are not motivated from a divine vision of a religious state. There is not a religious aspect to the Albanian form of enslavement, though there are market forces. The Albanians follow a general pattern of other organized crime groups that have participated in human trafficking; they thrive in areas with poor economic and employment prospects for women, organized extant criminal organizations, and a culture that subordinates the role of women in society.¹³

North Korea, ever the elusive to gathering information though it is, has shown signs of using human trafficking on a grand scale in a scheme to bring in foreign currency and perhaps generate money for other projects like its nuclear program. Obtaining information on North Korea's internal dealings poses a challenge because of the reclusive nature of the regime, but there are still witness accounts from North Koreans who escape the country. From these witnesses we catch a glimpse into the strategy of North Korea's new leader. Reports from refugees and researchers indicate that Kim Jong-un is ensnaring his people with job offers abroad and then sending them to tightly guarded places like logging camps in

¹²Kara, *Sex Trafficking*, 150

¹³Michael D. Lyman, Garry W. Potter, *Organized Crime* (Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Pearson, Prentice Hall, 2004), 211

Russia, factories in China, construction sites in the Middle East and Africa, digging military tunnels in Myanmar, and on fishing boats in Fiji.¹⁴

In 2012, the North Korea Policy Research Center estimated that anywhere from 60,000 to 65,000 North Koreans were working in 40 countries under the watchful eye of their government, bringing in \$150 million to \$320 million a year for the North Korean regime.¹⁵ Subcontracting makes it possible for slaves to be exploited in the legitimate economy,¹⁶ something it appears very likely that the North Korean government has seized upon. According to the North Korea Strategy Center, the regime could bring in as much as \$1.5-2.3 billion by exploiting its citizens in this way.¹⁷ Since then, the number of North Koreans sent abroad has swollen to 100,000 as Kim Jong-un seeks to find a way to fill his coffers despite international trade sanctions placed on the country.¹⁸ This is North Korea's response to sanctions and an effort to bring foreign currency back into the economy.¹⁹ Money sent back is not in the form of remittances, but instead go directly to the regime's accounts through the Labor Party's Office 39 and is used to reward the regime's elite followers and finance construction projects in North Korea to bolster the reputation of the Leader.²⁰

¹⁴Choe Sang-Hun "North Korea Exports Labor for Profit, Rights Groups Say," *New York Times*, February 19, 2015, URL: <<http://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/20/world/asia/north-koreans-toil-in-slavelike-conditions-abroad-rights-groups-say.html>>, accessed February 22, 2015

¹⁵North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*

¹⁶Beate Andrees, "Trafficking for Forced Labor in Europe" in *Forced Labor: Coercion and Exploitation in the Private Economy*, (eds) Beate Andrees, Patrick Belser, (Boulder, CO: Lynn Reinner Publishers, Inc., 2009), 89

¹⁷North Korea Strategy Center, *Overseas Laborers*, 12

¹⁸Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

¹⁹Pete Pattison, "North Koreans working as 'state-sponsored slaves' in Qatar" *The Guardian*, November 7, 2014, URL: <<http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2014/nov/07/north-koreans-working-state-sponsored-slaves-qatar>>, accessed March 15, 2015

²⁰Sang-Hun, *North Korea Exports Labor for Profit*

North Korea differs from the previous examples in some very basic ways. For one, North Korea is a nation and operating with much greater capacities than a terrorist group or an organized crime group. Secondly, the reasons that North Korea would want to use human trafficking differs from the other examples. Instead of enforcing a vision of the world from a religious perspective, North Korea seeks to evade international sanctions in compliance with its identity as a rogue state.

Strides are being made in the international arena already to end human trafficking. In addition to the protocols that have been listed, there have been improvements in the convictions of criminals in the international courts. Charles Taylor, former President of Liberia, was convicted in 2013 for breaking international law in an international court.²¹ This is a promising step forward, though there is still much to do. For instance, Palermo did not define “forced labor” but some definitions have been adopted from the International Labor Organization Convention 29.²² However, issues of immigration, ethnic conflicts, refugees, natural disasters, and legal precedents need to be examined and their implications for human trafficking assessed.

For example, victims of human trafficking are often not seen as holding rights when they are rescued but rather they are seen as instruments of the state to prosecute criminals.²³ Other nations attempting to encourage foreign investment hesitate to inspect foreign businesses for fear of losing capital, providing the opportunity for human trafficking

²¹International Justice Monitor, A project of the Open Society Justice Initiative, “Charles Taylor,” n.d., URL: <<http://www.ijmonitor.org/charles-taylor-background/>>, accessed February 18, 2015

²²Andrees, “Forced Labor”, 139

²³Andrees, “Forced Labor”, 142

operations to set up legitimate business fronts and escape detection.²⁴ Also, many victims of trafficking are engaged in criminal activities that can actually make them appear like criminals in many legal systems. Ultimately, through international protocols, regional directives and work like the Trafficking in Persons report from the U.S. Department of State, do an excellent job of sending a message to those who utilize human trafficking, they will largely be useless until victims (and their families) are protected, prevention is emphasized, and alternative revenue-generating endeavors are provided for those in poor regions.²⁵ For example, harsh penalties for human trafficking have been established in Balkan states, but organized crime has simply adapted to them and continue to thrive.²⁶

Moving forward, human trafficking should be examined as a national security threat to establish a proper course of action. Robert Hunter says, “Immoral issues like this [human trafficking], need to be seen as part of national security. Mainly, how do we, as civilized states, maintain standards that we believe are required for us to be secure in our persons and the ways in which our societies work? So I have broadened the definition of national security to include such matters. Now, it is not like someone turning on a nuclear weapon. It’s not in that league but it is not nothing. It is something that needs to be taken very seriously because it damages the fabric of both sending states and receiving states. Also, it leads to a production of money that can go into other illegal and immoral activities including drugs and including terrorism.”²⁷

²⁴Andrees, “Forced Labor”, 119

²⁵Andrees, “Forced Labor”, 113

²⁶Andrees, “Forced Labor”, 113

²⁷Robert Hunter, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview.

Bibliography

- “A New Era Has Arrived of Might and Dignity for the Muslims” *Dabiq*, Issue 1 (The Return of Khilafah), July 2014, retrieved from Clarion Project,
<<http://www.clarionproject.org/news/islamic-state-isis-isil-propaganda-magazine-dabiq>>, accessed January 20, 2015
- Amnesty International, *The State of the World's Human Rights*, February 25, 2015, URL:
<<https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/pol10/0001/2015/en/>>, accessed March 3, 2015
- Amnesty International, *Escape from Hell: Torture and Sexual Slavery in Islamic State Captivity in Iraq*, December 2014, URL: <<http://www.dw.de/amnesty-international-report-yazidi-women-and-girls-face-islamic-state-sexual-violence/a-18147468>>,
February 2015
- Andrees, Beate “Trafficking for Forced Labor in Europe” in *Forced Labor: Coercion and Exploitation in the Private Economy*, (eds) Beate Andrees, Patrick Belser, (Boulder, CO: Lynn Reinner Publishers, Inc., 2009)
- Aronowitz, Alexis A., *Human Trafficking: Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009)
- Arsovska, Jana, “The ‘G-Local’ Dimension of Albanian Organized Crime: Mafias, Strategic Migration and State Repression” *European Journal of Criminal Policy Research* (2014) 20:205–223
- Arsovska, Jana, “Understanding a ‘culture of crime and violence’: the Kanun of Lek Dukagjini and the Rise of the Albanian Sex-Slavery Rackets” in *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law & Criminal Justice*. (2006), Vol. 14 Issue 2

Azumah, John Alembillah *The Legacy of Arab-Islam in Africa: A Quest for Inter-Religious*

Dialogue (London, England: Oneworld Publications, 2014)

Bachmann, Helena, “As Europe Reels, Switzerland Builds New Barriers Against

Immigrants” in *TIME*, May 01, 2013, URL:

<<http://world.time.com/2013/05/01/bachmann-on-switzerland/>>, accessed July 23, 2014

Bales, Kevin, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (Berkley, CA:

University of California Press, 2012)

Baloan, Adriana, *Domestic Violence Against Women in Albania*, United Nations

International Children's Emergency Fund, n.d., URL:

<[http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=4&ved=0C DcQF](http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=4&ved=0C DcQF AD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.unicef.org%2Falbania%2Fdomviol_eng.pdf&ei=U YsMVdGcO9i2yASG9YLwCA&usg=AFQjCNFe_Rrgu89ZQFeioJeJianP9UJ0Ug&b vm=bv.88528373,bs.1,d.eXY)

[AD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.unicef.org%2Falbania%2Fdomviol_eng.pdf&ei=U YsMVdGcO9i2yASG9YLwCA&usg=AFQjCNFe_Rrgu89ZQFeioJeJianP9UJ0Ug&b vm=bv.88528373,bs.1,d.eXY](http://www.unicef.org/albania/domviol_eng.pdf)>

Barber, Matthew, “Freeing Yazidi Women: Combating a 21st Century Slavery Revival

Project” October 31, 2014, (presentation at the Middle East Program of the Woodrow

Wilson Center, Chicago), URL: <[http://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/freeing-yazidi-](http://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/freeing-yazidi-women-combating-21st-century-slavery-revival-project)

[women-combating-21st-century-slavery-revival-project](http://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/freeing-yazidi-women-combating-21st-century-slavery-revival-project)>, accessed December 27, 2014

Bechtol, Bruce E. Jr., *The Last Days of Kim Jong-Il: The North Korean Threat in a Changing*

Era, (Washington, DC: Potomac Books, 2013)

Bechtol, Bruce E. Jr., *Defiant Failed State*, (Washington, DC: Potomac Books, 2010)

Brooks, Rosa Ehrenreich, 2005. “Failed States, or the State as Failure?” in *The University of Chicago Law Review*, 72(4)

Botelho, Greg, “ISIS; Enslaving and Having Sex with ‘unbelieving’ Women and Girls OK” *CNN*, December 13, 2014, URL: <<http://www.cnn.com/2014/12/12/world/meast/isis-justification-female-slaves/>>, accessed January 15, 2015

Cheer, Louise, “Up to 40 Australian 'jihadi brides' have been recruited by Islamic State to partner with soldiers fighting in Syria... despite being used as sex slaves and suicide bombers” in *Dailymail.com*, February 25, 2015, URL: <<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2969277/Up-40-Australian-jihadi-brides-recruited-ISIS-partner-soldiers-fighting-Syria-despite-used-sex-slaves-suicide-bombers.html>>, accessed March 12, 2015

Destafano, Anthony M., *The War on Human Trafficking: U.S. Policy Assessed* (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 2008)

“Displaced Yazidis in dire need of help, UN warns” in *Daily Sabah*, January 26, 2015, URL: <<http://www.dailysabah.com/mideast/2015/01/26/displaced-yazidis-in-dire-need-of-help-un-warns>>, accessed February 28, 2015

Edmondson, Gail, Kate Carlisle, Inka Resch, Karen Nickel Anhalt, and Heidi Dawley

“Workers in Bondage (int’l edition): Europeans are only now learning of the horror of widespread sweatshops that use forced immigrant labor” Business Week Online, November 27, 2000 Issue, URL:
<http://www.businessweek.com/2000/00_48/b3709036.htm>, accessed January 28, 2015

EY, “Swiss Federal Council presents implementation plan regarding new Constitutional provisions on immigration management” July 2014, URL:
<<http://www.ey.com/GL/en/Services/Tax/Human-Capital/HC-Alert--Swiss-Federal-Council-presents-implementation-plan-regarding-new-Constitutional-provisions-on-immigration-management>>, accessed February 20, 2015

Freamon, Bernard, “ISIS says Islam justifies slavery - what does Islamic law say?” *CNN*, November 5, 2014, URL:
<<http://thecnnfreedomproject.blogs.cnn.com/2014/11/05/isis-says-islam-justifies-slavery-what-does-islamic-law-say/>>, accessed January 18, 2015

Ford, Tarquarius, *Denial of a Pimp* (unpublished), currently held as evidence in Ford’s trial, prosecuted by Stacie F. Beckerman, URL:
<<https://www.scribd.com/doc/217549648/Denial-of-a-Pimp>>, accessed February 26, 2015

Fund for Peace, Fragile State Index, URL: <<http://ffp.statesindex.org/rankings-2014>>, accessed December 28, 2014 (site under maintenance during time of submission)

Hawk, David, *The Hidden Gulag*, Report by Committee for Human Rights in North Korea (Washington, DC: 2012)

Henriksen, H. Thomas, *America and the Rogue States* (New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012)

Hislope, Robert (2002) "Organized Crime in a Disorganized State." *Problems Of Post Communism*, 49(3)

Hudson, Valerie, (2015, March 24). Email interview

Hunter, Robert, (2014, February 26). Telephone interview

Human Rights Watch, "Burma: World's Highest Number of Child Soldiers" October 17, 2002, URL: <<http://www.hrw.org/news/2002/10/15/burma-worlds-highest-number-child-soldiers>>, accessed March 10, 2015

Human Rights Watch for the United Nations World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance. Durban, South Africa, September 2001, "Caste Discrimination: A Global Concern" URL: <<http://www.hrw.org/reports/2001/globalcaste/caste0801-03.htm>>, accessed February 13, 2015

International Justice Monitor, A project of the Open Society Justice Initiative, "Charles Taylor," n.d., URL: <<http://www.ijmonitor.org/charles-taylor-background/>>, accessed February 18, 2015

International Labor Organization, *Forced Labor, Human Trafficking and Slavery*, URL: <<http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/lang--en/index.htm>>, accessed 27 February, 2015

Kara, Siddharth, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009)

- Khaleeli, Homa, "Domestic Terrorism; housewives taught how to provide battle snacks" *The Guardian*, November 5, 2014, URL:
<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/shortcuts/2014/nov/05/isis-housewives-told-to-prepare-battle-snacks>>, January 14, 2015
- Kumar, T., *China's Repatriation of North Korean Refugees*, Testimony before the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, March 5, 2012, retrieved from Amnesty International's website, URL: <<http://www.amnestyusa.org/news/news-item/china-s-repatriation-of-north-korean-refugees>>, accessed February 23, 2015
- Loven, Jennifer, "Obama Calls North Korea 'Extraordinarily Provocative'" *Huffington Post*, June 6, 2009, URL: <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2009/06/06/obama-calls-north-korea-e_n_212149.html>, accessed May 7, 2014
- Lyman, Michael D., Potter, Garry W., *Organized Crime* (Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Pearson, Prentice Hall, 2004)
- Matthews, Chris, "Fortune 5: The biggest organized crime groups in the world" *Fortune Magazine* online edition, September 14, 2014, URL:
<<http://fortune.com/2014/09/14/biggest-organized-crime-groups-in-the-world/>>, February 20, 2015
- Mittleman, James H., *Hyper-Conflict: Globalization and Insecurity* (Stanford Security Studies, Kindle Edition, 2010)
- Neely, Michelle Clark, "Paper Tigers? How the Asian Economies Lost Their Bite," in *The Regional Economist*, January 1999

North Korea Strategy Center, *The Conditions of the North Korean Overseas Laborer*, May 2013, URL: <<http://en.nksc.co.kr/our-work/research/reports/nksc-report-on-the-human-rights-conditions-of-overseas-north-korean-laborers/>>, accessed March 2, 2015

Omar, Manal, “The Women in the Middle of the War” *Foreign Policy* online edition, March 18, 2015, URL: <http://foreignpolicy.com/2015/03/18/the-women-in-the-middle-of-the-war/?utm_content=bufferbf2fb&utm_medium=social&utm_source=facebook.com&utm_campaign=buffer>, accessed March 19, 2015

Pattisson, Pete, “North Koreans working as ‘state-sponsored slaves’ in Qatar” *The Guardian*, November 7, 2014, URL: <<http://www.theguardian.com/global/development/2014/nov/07/north-koreans-working-state-sponsored-slaves-qatar>>, accessed March 15, 2015

Rotberg, R.I., “Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States: Causes and Indicators”, Chapter 1, in *Failed States, Collapsed States, Weak States*. World Peace Foundation, 2003

Rubenstein, Richard L., *Jihad and Genocide* (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2010)

- Ruchti, Lisa C., “Fear Fraud, and Complexities: The Influence of Gender on Human Trafficking” in *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives*, Ed. Mary C. Burke (New York, NY: Routledge, 2013)
- Salih, Mohammed A, van Wilgenburg, Wladimir, “Iraqi Yazidis: 'If we move they will kill us'” in *Aljazeera*, August 5, 2014, URL: <<http://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2014/08/iraqi-yazidis-if-move-they-will-kill-us-20148513656188206.html>>, accessed February 8, 2015
- Sanchez, Ray, “United Nations investigates claim of ISIS organ theft” CNN, February 19, 2015, URL: <<http://www.cnn.com/2015/02/18/middleeast/isis-organ-harvesting-claim/>>, accessed March 3, 2015
- Sang-Hun, Choe “North Korea Exports Labor for Profit, Rights Groups Say,” *New York Times*, February 19, 2015, URL: <<http://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/20/world/asia/north-koreans-toil-in-slavelike-conditions-abroad-rights-groups-say.html>>, accessed February 22, 2015
- Schengen Agreement, June 19, 2000, Chapter I, Article II
- Semple, Kirk, “Yazidi Girls Seized by ISIS Speak Out After Escape” in *The New York Times*, November 14, 2014, URL <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/11/15/world/middleeast/yazidi-girls-seized-by-isis-speak-out-after-escape.html?_r=0>, accessed December 8, 2015
- Shelley, Louise, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2010)

Shelley, Louise, “ISIS, Boko Haram, and the Growing Role of Human Trafficking in 21st

Century Terrorism” *Daily Beast*, December 26, 2014, URL:

<<http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2014/12/26/isis-boko-haram-and-the-growing-role-of-human-trafficking-in-21st-century-terrorism.html>>, accessed January 10, 2015

Smith, Samuel, “ISIS Trafficking Human Organs from Bodies of Kidnapped Captives, Dead Soldiers and Injured Prisoners, Mosul Doctor Says” in *The Christian Post*, December 8, 2014, URL: <<http://www.christianpost.com/news/isis-trafficking-human-organs-from-bodies-of-kidnapped-captives-dead-soldiers-and-injured-prisoners-mosul-doctor-says-130842/>>, accessed January 9, 2015

Singer, P.W., *Children at War* (New York, NY: Pantheon Books, 2005)

Stoecker, Sally, “The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime” (*Demokratizatsiya*, Vol. 8, No. 1, Winter 2000)

“Study Shows Sex Trafficking Has Become More Profitable Than Selling Drugs” in *Local Memphis*, September 4, 2013, URL: <<http://www.localmemphis.com/news/local/story/Study-Shows-Sex-Trafficking-Has-Become-More/d/story/t2khCwnCd0S35XFCMoxAHw>>, accessed February 21, 2015

Soon, Kim Young, *Human rights in North Korea [electronic resource] : challenges and opportunities : hearing before the Subcommittee on Africa, Global Health, and Human Rights of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, first session, September 20, 2011*. n.p.: Washington : U.S. G.P.O., 2011., 2011. *Government Printing Office Catalog*, EBSCOhost (accessed March 16, 2015)

The Fund for Peace, *Failed State Index 2011*

“The Revival of Slavery before the Hour” *Dabiq*, Issue 4, July 2014, retrieved from Clarion Project, <<http://www.clarionproject.org/news/islamic-state-isis-isil-propaganda-magazine-dabiq>>, accessed January 20, 2015, 15

The state of affairs in the Balkans [electronic resource]: hearing before the Subcommittee on Europe and Eurasia of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, first session, November 15, 2011. (2011).
Washington : U.S. G.P.O., 2011

“Tourisme Sexuel”, U.S. Department of State Publication 11407 Office of the Under Secretary for Democracy and Global Affairs and Bureau of Public Affairs, Revised June 2009

UN High Commissioner for Refugees, *War’s Human Cost: UNHCR Global Trends 2013*, June 20, 2014, URL: <<http://reliefweb.int/report/world/unhcr-global-trends-2013-wars-human-cost>>, accessed July 23, 2014 from Reliefweb.net

United Nations, *Special Concerns*, URL: <<http://www.un.org/rights/concerns.htm>>, accessed March 12, 2015

UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs “OCHA Flash Update: Iraq Crisis – Significant Displacement from Sinjar, No. 2 | 4 August 2014” August 4, 2014, retrieved from *Reliefweb*, URL: <<http://reliefweb.int/report/iraq/ocha-flash-update-iraq-crisis-significant-displacement-sinjar-no-2-4-august-2014>>, accessed February 17, 2015

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Human Trafficking FAQs*, URL:

<http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/faqs.html#Who_are_the_victims_and_culprits_of_human_trafficking>,
accessed 10 March, 2015

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons*, (New York, NY: United Nations Publication, 2006)

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), Global Report on the Trafficking in Persons, *Human Trafficking: A Crime that Shames Us All*, February 2009

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols*, URL:

<<http://www.unodc.org/unodc/treaties/CTOC/>>, accessed 10 March, 2015

United Nations Human Rights, Office for the High Commissioner for Human Rights,

“Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime” URL:

<<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/ProtocolTraffickingInPersons.aspx>>, accessed January 8, 2015

United Nations Population Fund, *Regional Situation Report for Syria Crisis #27 – November 2014*, November 2014, URL: <<http://www.unfpa.org/resources/regional-situation-report-syria-crisis-27-november-2014>>, accessed January 10, 2015

U.S. Department of State, “Topics of Special Interest” URL:

<<http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2014/226646.htm>>, accessed January 8, 2015

U.S. Department of State, *2013 Human Rights Reports: Democratic People's Republic of Korea*, February 27, 2014, URL:

<<http://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/2013/eap/220202.html>>, accessed March 10, 2015, Section 7, D

Weiss, Michael, Hassan, Hassan *ISIS: Inside the Army of Terror [Kindle Edition]*, (New York, New York: Simon and Schuster Digital Sales Inc., n.d.)

Wessells, Michael, *Child Soldiers: From Violence to Protection* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2006)

Young, Lee Hae, *Lives for Sale: Personal Accounts of Women Fleeing North Korea to China*, Report by Committee for Human Rights in North Korea, (Washington, DC: 2009)

Young, Finlay, “Lost boys: What became of Liberia's child soldiers?” in *The Independent*, Saturday 14 April, 2012, URL:

<<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/africa/lost-boys-what-became-of-liberias-child-soldiers-7637101.html>>, accessed March 12, 2015

